

In The Matter Of:

*Resolution Copper Project and Land Exchange Draft EIS
Public Hearing*

*Public Comments
October 10, 2019*



**G R I F F I N G R O U P
I N T E R N A T I O N A L**

2398 East Camelback Road, Suite 260
Phoenix, Arizona 85016

*Original File USFS 101019 SWCA DDL.TXT
Min-U-Script® with Word Index*

RESOLUTION COPPER PROJECT AND)
)
LAND EXCHANGE DRAFT EIS)
)
PUBLIC HEARING)
_____)

Hotel Tempe/Phoenix Airport Inn
1651 West Baseline Road
Tempe, Arizona

PUBLIC COMMENTS

October 10, 2019
6:03 p.m.

REPORTED BY:
DONNA DELAVINA, RPR
Certified Reporter
Certificate No. 50468

PREPARED FOR:
U.S. FOREST SERVICE

(Original)

PUBLIC COMMENTS

	SPEAKER	PAGE
1		
2		
3	Garrick Taylor.....	4
4	Morgun Frejo.....	6
5	Betty Wagner.....	8
6	Basse Pike.....	10
7	Tom Wright.....	12
8	Vanessa Nosie.....	14
9	Brett Tanner.....	16
10	Eileen Baden.....	17
11	Rick Grinnell.....	20
12	Thaddeus Barringer.....	22
13	Chris Spidle.....	23
14	Manuel Rangel.....	25
15	Timothy Wight.....	27
16	Kathy Mohr-Almeida.....	28
17	Mark Horlings.....	29
18	Esteban Lopez.....	31
19	Roger Featherstone.....	33
20	Manuel Pino.....	35
21	Laura Medina.....	37
22	Steve Trussell.....	39
23	Hannah Bercovici.....	42
24	Anna Jeffrey.....	44
25	Sandra Rambler.....	46

1	Mark Davis.....	48
2	Roy Chavez.....	49
3	Leslie Glass.....	52
4	Wendsler Nosie, Senior.....	54
5	Jim Dublinski.....	56
6	Jessica Milnes.....	58
7	Ryan Chamberlin.....	60
8	Dr. Lian Bighorse.....	62
9	Min Yve.....	64
10	Duke Romero.....	66
11	Brian Ballard.....	68
12	Sylvia Barrett.....	71
13	Darlene Leslie.....	73
14	Miguel Garcia.....	76
15	Lucinda Hinojos.....	78
16	Carlos Gonzales.....	80
17	Manuel Saldana.....	82

18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1 GARRICK TAYLOR: Thank you. For the
2 record, Garrick Taylor, G-a-r-r-i-c-k, Taylor,
3 T-a-y-l-o-r. I'm here on behalf of the Arizona Chamber
4 of Commerce and Industry.

5 On behalf of the Chamber, I would like to
6 commend the Forest Service for this sound, thorough and
7 robust manner in which supplied the NEPA throughout the
8 process. The extensive engagement process, analysis
9 and change in the scope of the project components in
10 the DEIS, most notably the change in location and type
11 of tailings management, is evidence that the Forest
12 Service and Resolution Copper have both listened and
13 responded to public concerns and comments.

14 Let's remember this process dates back to
15 2013. I'm going to urge the Tonto National Forest not
16 to entertain any public comment period extension
17 requests. I'm going to urge the comments received
18 during this 90-day period be addressed in a timely
19 manner and complete the Final Environment Impact
20 Statement without delay, so that the local communities,
21 the state, and the nation may realize the benefits of
22 this project sooner rather than later.

23 It should be noted that the Resolution
24 Copper land exchange was one of 80 land exchange
25 packages passed in the 2014 National Defense

1 Authorization Act. It received strong bipartisan
2 support under the Obama administration. The Resolution
3 Copper land exchange is the one of those land exchanges
4 which requires a full NEPA EIS process to be undertaken
5 before the transfer of land title. This is a result of
6 Resolution Copper and elected officials responding to
7 Congressional testimony where this impressive and
8 process step was requested.

9 As for something to note, in this land
10 exchange there is an explicit requirement for
11 preservation of Apache Leap, which resulted in the
12 creation of the Apache Leap special management area and
13 a requirement to maintain access to the Oak Flat
14 campground area for as long as it is safe. Both items
15 were completed at the request of tribes and local
16 communities specifically requested during the 2009
17 Congressional testimony.

18 The Chamber fully supports the preferred
19 tailings storage facility alternative known as Skunk
20 Camp. This location not only addresses public concerns
21 related to tailings storage on federal lands, but also
22 moves it away from large population areas and employs
23 design standards, including safety, water recycling,
24 and reclamation requirements that meet or exceed
25 industry best practices from around the world.

1 And finally, the DEIS outlines the
2 spectacular economic benefits to local schools,
3 communities, counties, and the state by delivering
4 nearly 3,700 high-paying jobs and more than a billion
5 dollars in economic value annually.

6 However, the Forest Service may have
7 underestimated local tax revenues that will be realized
8 through construction activities, new commercials
9 developments, such as housing, hotels, retail and more
10 which will occur as a result of the operation.

11 The Final EIS should consider whether
12 there are additional government revenue streams that
13 are not quantified in the current analysis.

14 I appreciate the chance to visit with you
15 this evening and provide these comments.

16 MORGUN FREJO: Yes. My name is Morgun,
17 M-o-r-g-u-n, Frejo, F-r-e-j-o.

18 I want to start off by saying that
19 Mr. Bosworth needs to be here at all of these public
20 hearings, since he has a major decision in this
21 project.

22 And, also, how can you mitigate the water
23 use for this project, when there's a major impact by
24 removing it in the first place? And how can you
25 guarantee that the subsidence in this project will not

1 affect either Highway 60, Apache Leap, or Devil's
2 Canyon also know as Guan (phonetic) Canyon. And the
3 locals in the surrounding area, in the presentation
4 video, it's stated that only 5 percent will be noticed
5 in a haze from hikers. But yet how will the locals in
6 the surrounding areas be affected?

7 I stated previously in other statements at
8 these hearings that this project is a form of continued
9 spiritual genocide and ecological genocide. As
10 indigenous people, we use almost every natural resource
11 that we can in our ceremonies. It connects us to
12 Mother Earth and this illegal project that you all are
13 trying to push through will deeply impact, not only my
14 family, but other indigenous communities to this area.

15 This is a direct attack on my family. My
16 daughters have had their coming of age ceremonies
17 there. You are cutting their lives in half with this.
18 I've had many opportunities to pick and use a lot of
19 natural resources from wood to sage, cedar. The rocks
20 that are in our ceremonies that we sing -- in singing
21 and pray, this project is the only one that I know of
22 that's being pushed through such an important area.

23 I've never heard of a project like this
24 being built through a church or synagogue or a
25 cemetery. There are lineages in -- from the

1 surrounding area that connects other families to this
2 area. You are desecrating their bodies. Would you
3 desecrate the ones buried in Arlington Cemetery in
4 D.C.?

5 And I ask and each everyone of you, the
6 ones that are not signed up to speak, in the opening at
7 the end, please use your voice. This affects all of
8 us. This is not just an indigenous issue. This is not
9 just community issues in the surrounding areas. This
10 is a human rights issue. This a direct attack on
11 water. We all need water to survive. None of us can
12 live without it. What are we going to do when all of
13 the water in this area is used up and desecrated
14 itself. There is no respect in this project. There is
15 no respect for local indigenous communities. And there
16 is no respect on the surrounding areas.

17 Thank you.

18 BETTY WAGNER: Good evening. My name is
19 Betty Wagner, B-e-t-t-y W-a-g-n-e-r.

20 And I'm here in support, certainly of the
21 indigenous issues that are impacted by this project, as
22 well as -- I understand the project is moving forward.
23 One of the things -- or some of the things that I see
24 missing in the statement and how things are moving
25 forward is exactly the impact to the water. How much?

1 How fast? How huge this impact is going to be? We see
2 all the numbers. It's hard -- it's hard to believe
3 that those are all true.

4 We, ourselves, our own family is involved
5 in surface water rights and defending those on a state
6 level and I know how hard we had to work to defend
7 those rights.

8 And I implore the -- certainly the Forest
9 Service to really, really work with the engineers, work
10 with everybody to do a bang-up job of beating that
11 issue to death, in the analysis.

12 The second thing is as it relates to the
13 recreational areas. I have a son who is a rock
14 climber, so I'm here to represent some of the climbers
15 tonight attune to say: Okay, great this is going to
16 happen. Now what's the financial commitment to really
17 make the new area as good as it can be? Regardless of
18 how far away and how awful it is, what you can do to
19 make be an adequate -- I don't know if I can even say
20 that -- replacement to what's being lost in terms of
21 Queen Creek. So I encourage that piece.

22 The third and last thing for me is the
23 impact on the local community, as it relates to
24 Superior. I understand and I've been reading
25 everything in the newspapers that track all of the

1 things that are going to happen. But where is the
2 support to the infrastructure for Superior? You're
3 going to have apartments. You're going to have more
4 water. You're going to have more sewer, more
5 everything. And where is the financial commitment and
6 support from either the Forest Service or what you
7 negotiate with Resolution to be able to support the
8 requirements and what has to happen to really make
9 Superior a vibrant town in light of -- we're all saying
10 this is going to be wonderful for them, we don't see
11 it yet.

12 So thank you for listening and I
13 appreciate the opportunity. Thank you.

14 BAASE PIKE: Hi. (Speaking Native
15 language.)

16 (Speaking Native language.) My name is
17 Basse Pike, B-a-a-s-e P-i-k-e.

18 I would first like to say that I oppose
19 this land exchange and Resolution Copper mining and
20 hurting my Native land Oak Flat. I would just like to
21 say that every since I was little, my family has been
22 fighting for these fights [sic]. I remember -- I
23 remember running and protecting our home on Mount
24 Graham. And then always fighting for Oak Flat.

25 And I just want to say, I'm tired -- I'm

1 tired of these corporations trying to take my land,
2 trying to hurt Mother Earth. Mother Earth doesn't need
3 to be hurt. What's going to happen to all the water
4 when it's gone? We all (unintelligible) water. So
5 what's going to happen when it's gone?

6 We all know we need the plants and the
7 earth and everything. So why are you trying to take it
8 away? Especially Oak Flat. Oak Flat has the acorn I
9 pick. Ever since I was little, I would go there and
10 pick it. So why are you going to take that -- why are
11 you going to take that tradition away from me? What am
12 I going to do when I have kids and grandchildren and I
13 won't be able to take them to Oak Flat and show them
14 the acorn and tell the stories that my
15 great-grandmother would tell me about Oak Flat. So
16 what are you going to do?

17 And also Oak Flat is really, really sacred
18 to me. It's in our traditional stories. And you say
19 it's going to destroy like prehistoric and historic
20 stuff. When I'm here present today and my family are
21 here, we are not gone. We are not history. We're
22 right here. Blood and everything. We're human beings
23 and it's still -- and we're still protecting -- we're
24 still doing traditional stuff at Oak Flat. So why you
25 are going to take it away so that we don't do it

1 anymore? When I honestly do it.

2 So I would just like to say do not mine
3 Oak Flat. Oak Flat is my home. They're going to
4 destroy it. What's going to happen to the water and
5 the air? Like it's going to affect every single one of
6 us. And I'm fighting to protect you guys and your air
7 and your water that you're going to drink and you're
8 going to breathe in. So just do not mine Oak Flat.
9 That's it.

10 TOM WRIGHT: My name is Tom Wright, T-o-m
11 W-r-i-g-h-t. I live about a five-minute drive from
12 here. And I'm not sure who picked this location. But
13 if you asked me, I probably could have found a place
14 with less parking, and a smaller room and a stuffier
15 (unintelligible). So next time you've having a
16 meeting, I'm available as a consultant. Sorry.

17 Okay. Three minutes. Three minutes on a
18 microphone, that isn't very long. It's okay. I don't
19 have too much to say. I do have substantive comments,
20 particularly about the (unintelligible). I will be
21 submitting those as written comments later. For right
22 now, I want to (unintelligible) a few comments.

23 Environmental impact statements are
24 supposed to benefit the American people by gathering
25 information and evaluating alternatives in advance of

1 proposed actions that have major impacts on our
2 environment. The whole purpose of an EIS is to look
3 before you leap.

4 The Resolution Copper plan is not a look,
5 it's a leap right off the edge of a high cliff. It's
6 not about making an informed choice. It's about
7 providing cover for the worse sort of political
8 dealmaking. Everybody in this room knows or should
9 know how we all got to this point.

10 It's already in the public record and it
11 represents what I consider to be a disgraceful attack
12 on the rights of citizens to have a meaningful say on
13 how the public resources are managed and who has to
14 sacrifice what for gross profit.

15 The one thing I do want to make clear, I
16 don't blame the Forest Service. I know there's a lot
17 of (unintelligible) sometimes. (Unintelligible)
18 because they were pushed, just like the rest of us
19 were. I believe that they're doing the best they can
20 with this stinking mandate that they were given. In my
21 own way, I'm doing my best too.

22 I think we need to save Oak Flat. We need
23 to preserve Arizona's land, the water, the wild life,
24 the biological and cultural resources. We deserve a
25 lot better than a big hole in the ground and

1 (unintelligible) toxic waste leaching into the
2 aquifers.

3 Thanks.

4 VANESSA NOISE: (Speaking Native
5 language.)

6 V-a-n-e-s-s-a N-o-s-i-e.

7 Well, first, like everybody has said,
8 three minutes isn't enough, when all our lives matter.
9 I come from (speaking Native language).

10 That was my youngest daughter speaking.
11 So can you see how it breaks my heart to know that
12 she's worried about her life. You know, so I'm
13 standing here and (unintelligible) as indigenous people
14 that we're fighting -- we're always fighting to protect
15 who we are, to protect our land, to protect our
16 identity, to protect our water and those yet to be
17 born.

18 But we as indigenous people also protect
19 every single one of you guys sitting here. You know,
20 Tempe, if it didn't affect the metropolitan area and
21 the Tempe area and all the Phoenix, the Valley area, we
22 wouldn't be here.

23 So I think you guys got to remember this
24 DEIS is incomplete. Because what's going to happen
25 when the toxic tailings are put near the metropolitan

1 area? That's what you guys are going to be breathing
2 in. We as indigenous people have been fighting for
3 over 500 years and it hasn't stopped. When are we
4 going to get a win? When are we going to matter?

5 I'm sorry, I get emotional, but I'm
6 talking about my life that is being effected. Every
7 single day I have to get up and pray, like my ancestors
8 did. But I pray for everyone in this world. My
9 grandma used to tell me when the sun starts to rise,
10 you protect -- you pray for your people here, all the
11 people on this side and you pray for the people on the
12 other side of the world. And when the sun sets, you do
13 the same thing.

14 So remember that. All you guys that are
15 in position, you know you can stop this. You know you
16 can delay it. Neil should have been here. This is his
17 decision. And he's right, yes, the Tonto Forest
18 Service is put in a hard position, but they have the
19 power to make something happen. They have the power to
20 protect our people. They have the power to show that
21 we all care.

22 Are you going to be able to drink dirty
23 water? Are you going to be able to breath the dirty
24 air? Are you guys going to be able to raise your kids
25 in an environment that they can be able to go outside

1 and play? Because right now I'm worried about my
2 grandchildren when they come. I'm going to worry about
3 my great-grandchildren when they're here on this earth.
4 What kind of world are we going to leave them?

5 We talk about economic development. We
6 know that Resolution Copper ain't going to give the
7 economic development that it promises. No way. We
8 know that nobody can go withstand that heat.

9 So it's -- you know, come on you guys,
10 wake up. Tonto, wake up. Make moral decisions that's
11 going to benefit all people. I hate seeing my daughter
12 up here pleading and asking you guys to recognize her,
13 that her life matters. She should -- we right now
14 should be at a time of unification and that we should
15 be protecting every one of us. We all matter, no
16 matter what color, what religion you believe in, we
17 matter. Life matters.

18 (Speaking Native language.)

19 BRETT TANNER: Good evening. My name is
20 Brett Tanner, B-r-e-t-t T-a-n-n-e-r. And good evening
21 everybody.

22 First, I want to extend my respect to
23 those that have spoke so far and shared heartfelt
24 thoughts. I represent the Arizona Mining Industry Gets
25 Our Support or more commonly known as AMIGOS. AMIGOS

1 is a group of hundreds of small- and mid-sized
2 companies and we rely on the mining industry for our
3 livelihood and we are here -- I'm here to represent the
4 AMIGOS and extend our support for the project.

5 Many of our companies are actually focused
6 on environment and sustainability. They spend
7 every day of their lives developing technologies and
8 experience to prevent challenges that have been
9 expressed here and to make sure that we do things safe.
10 And I encourage the Forest Service to continue the
11 efforts in making sure that will take place. But we're
12 activity engaged in the mining industry as it was
13 protecting our environment and doing it in a fair and
14 safe manner.

15 I want to just extend our appreciation for
16 the process, for the opportunity to stand up and speak.
17 Whether we agree or disagree, the process is fair and
18 just and I appreciate the opportunity. And, again, as
19 a representative of the AMIGOS, we support this
20 project.

21 Thank you.

22 EILEEN BADEN: Hi. My name's Eileen
23 Baden, E-i-l-e-e-n, last name, B-a-d-e-n.

24 I just wanted to -- you just said it was a
25 fair and just process. To me, it doesn't seem like

1 it's a fair and just process because Neil cannot choose
2 the no action alternative. I've never heard of another
3 NEPA project where the no action alternative cannot be
4 chosen. Usually the decision maker -- the whole idea
5 behind NEPA is that you're supposed to look before you
6 leap. So he should be able to choose the no action
7 alternative if he's concerned that the environmental
8 and social impacts outweigh the benefit of the project.

9 I have some concerns about why we
10 didn't -- you know, other alternatives weren't looked
11 at because they weren't reasonable. But why weren't
12 they reasonable? Were they too expensive and was
13 Resolution Copper not willing to pay that? You know,
14 so really I haven't seen a lot of explanation about
15 why. It just says it's not reasonable and then it's --
16 I don't see the explanation for that.

17 I also just don't know how typical it
18 is -- you know, so does anybody here represent the
19 Forest Service?

20 So do you have any other projects where a
21 private company has, like, taken land and the Forest
22 Service had to approve it?

23 Okay. You're not answering any questions.

24 Okay. So I also just -- Oak Flat was a
25 withdraw area. It was withdrawn from mining in 1955

1 for a public land order and so usually we look at land
2 management plans before we just decide that a project
3 is going to move forward. So I don't know why we're
4 able to go in and now say, okay, it was withdrawn from
5 mining in 1955, but now it's open to mining.

6 I'm wondering if the EIS takes -- defines
7 not only the U.S. Forest Service's purpose and need to
8 respond to the request, but does it define the
9 applicant's purpose and need of why we're doing this
10 project? Do we really need more copper? Is that --
11 you know, so I think defining the applicant's purpose
12 and need in the EIS is very beneficial.

13 Also, we said -- they said later on that
14 the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers would approve any
15 mining, that's what they said in the video. But I
16 think because by law that the U.S. Forest Service has
17 to approve this project, that the U.S. Army Corps of
18 Engineers also has to approve any permitting that comes
19 in.

20 Also, if you want to comment on this
21 project, I encourage you to look up how to write a
22 substantive comment. You need to write it in terms
23 that you're applying it to the National Environmental
24 Policy Act. If you just say that you don't want the
25 mine built, they can dismiss that. So be sure to look

1 into how to comment properly, if you have concerns
2 about how the real impacts relating to water quality or
3 other things along that line.

4 I also would like to submit formal request
5 to extend the public comment period and give people,
6 who are maybe just now just learning about this project
7 a little bit more time to comment on the Draft EIS.

8 Also, the U.S. Forest Service is open to
9 hearing about potential mitigation measures for
10 recreation. So if you have particular recommendations,
11 I saw on the website you that can submit those.

12 Thank you.

13 RICK GRINNELL: Good evening. My name is
14 Rick Grinnell, R-i-c-k, Grinnell, G-r-i-n-n-e-l-l.

15 First of all, to the Forest Service and
16 its representatives, this is a very long and arduous
17 process that requires a whole lot of expertise, time
18 and energy and attention to detail.

19 To the general public, I don't think we
20 have any real understanding how intricate -- and the
21 requirements in order to fulfill the obligations under
22 the law. So thank you very much.

23 I would also like to say that since 1950
24 the population of the world has gone from a little over
25 2.5 billion people to over 7.7 billion people, over

1 three times. Since 1950 the need of copper has gone up
2 nine times and will continue to do so. We can't live
3 in a world today without mining, period.

4 And the other lady that just spoke,
5 congratulations, you've got a brave young lady. And I
6 have nine grandkids and now two great-grand kids. I'm
7 feeling my age. But the important part when we discuss
8 things with the kids is I tell them, I want you to
9 share your ideas, your opinions. You don't have to
10 agree with me. But what I would ask is that we would
11 have an open and honest dialogue about the facts. And
12 the facts of this project are going to be designed and
13 created at the end of this process for everybody to
14 have an opportunity to review again.

15 Mining is not without its shortcomings.
16 But then, again, there's nothing in our lives that we
17 do that don't have consequences. I venture to guess
18 how many of us in here maybe have artificial knees or
19 back surgeries. How about pacemakers? Hearing aids,
20 eyeglasses. Without mining there is nothing in our
21 lives that it doesn't touch because of mining.

22 I know that my grandkids aren't willing to
23 give up their cell phones. They would give up my
24 wallet before their cell phone, and that's a fact of
25 life. Without the computers, the education system that

1 we all thrive that they enhance be better.

2 And, again, you know, they say the enemy
3 of perfect -- or perfect is the enemy of good. You
4 know, as much as anything else, we have to -- we really
5 need to understand, there are consequences. And the
6 rules and regulations in this country for mining
7 exceeds anywhere else in the world. So if we don't
8 build it here, where are we going to build it?

9 Thank you.

10 THADDEUS BARRINGER: Hello. My name is
11 Thaddeus Barringer, T-h-a-d-d-e-u-s, Barringer,
12 B-a-r-r-i-n-g-e-r.

13 I was a welder out at Resolution Copper
14 for 10 years and also a rock climber, that's how they
15 found me. And I just kind of laughed at them the whole
16 time thinking that they're never going to get the deal.
17 And then John McCain goes in the dead of night and puts
18 it in the National Defense bill. There is no public
19 hearing that we were able to vote on as a society.
20 Because I guarantee you, this would not be happening
21 right now. If you guys gave all of Phoenix, all of
22 Arizona the opportunity to vote on it, it wouldn't have
23 happened. It's a bad deal for Arizona.

24 I think we need copper, absolutely. But
25 we need to get it in a responsible manner. We need to

1 mine it without surface disturbance. This is the year
2 2019. If you can't extract copper without destroying
3 the surface, then guess what, you can't get it yet.
4 You can't have it. Not to mention the water is being
5 polluted. I'm very happy to hear that you guys moved
6 the tailings pond from right above Queen Valley to
7 south of Superior, that was good. But, God damn, guys,
8 stop, please.

9 CHRIS SPIDLE: Chris Spidle, C-h-r-i-s
10 S-p-i-d-l-e.

11 I only have a short time, so I'm going to
12 have to make this pretty blunt. I see a lot of people
13 here, but very few people in the past have spoken up
14 and those just won't get recorded. So if there's extra
15 time, I suggest that you do something about that.

16 Here's the problem, and I said I'm going
17 to be blunt. I'm sorry, I've done a lot of research.
18 I've spent about 100 hours investigating this deal on
19 the Internet and I've spent time double-checking my
20 facts, rechecking the sources, making sure that what
21 I'm saying is what I believe in my heart to be true.
22 And so this is my opinion, and I'm saying this based
23 upon my right to free speech. So even though it may
24 sound kind of rough, I want you to know that I think I
25 have a right to say this.

1 And that is that this whole deal is a
2 sham. This whole deal is rigged. It's prewired. And
3 the people in this room that had anything to do with
4 it, meaning SWCA, the owner of SWCA, Nature
5 Conservancy, people from the mine, people from the
6 Forest Service are complicit in it. Because if they
7 actively engaged in it or they didn't look the right
8 direction when they should have.

9 And I want you to know that I am not
10 opposed to the mine. I'm not opposed to anything
11 having to do with this, publicly. I have my personal
12 feelings, but that's not what I'm speaking about. I'm
13 telling you that this is a sham, because I believe that
14 if they're going to do it, they need to do it legally
15 and they need to follow the rules.

16 And I'll tell you why it's a sham. The
17 sham is that Steven W. Carothers, SWC, as in SWCA, has
18 been a member of the Nature Conservancy Board of
19 Directors since 1988. Nature Conservancy is heavily
20 invested in 7B Ranch, which represents 70 percent of
21 the land in the land swap. Without the 7B Ranch, the
22 deal fails and they've been pumping up the value of
23 that so that it can equal it. They're going to --
24 Resolution has spent approximately \$18 million to get
25 access to \$130 billion worth of copper and they needed

1 to make 7B Ranch look good. Now that's what they've
2 done.

3 Now, what you have is a contracting
4 officer who went onto the GSA schedules and just
5 selected somebody. And, you know what, it got to
6 bothering me today because when he stuck his hand in
7 the jar and pulled out a name, he just so happened to
8 get Steven B. [sic] Carothers' company, who is heavily
9 invested in the 7B Ranch for the last 30 years.

10 Now you tell me how this DEIS can be
11 unbiased. If you look at it and you see things that
12 don't make sense, things that you think got glossed
13 over, I'm telling you why I think that happened. It
14 happened because it's a sham. It should be thrown out.
15 It should be started again. The 7B Ranch and Steven
16 Carothers cannot coexist in this deal. One of them has
17 to go. You throw out 7B Ranch, it will invalidate
18 McCain's deal. You throw out SWCA, you start all over
19 again.

20 And that's my comment. Thank you.

21 MANUEL RANGEL: Hi. My name's Manny,
22 M-a-n-u-e-l R-a-n-g-e-l. I'm a rock climber. And I've
23 been climbing since 1977 in the Marine Corps. I
24 learned how to climb in Korea. I've climbed in England
25 in the gritstone hills, in France in and Buoux gorge.

1 In the dome lights (phonetic) of Italy, the beaches of
2 Thailand and Oak Flat.

3 The people that I've met travel throughout
4 the world who climb, some of them have climbed Oak
5 Flat. Up until the time this mine came into existence,
6 we had maybe every spring 2- to 3,000 people show up
7 from all over the United States and the world to come
8 out there to climb, have a good time and recreate and
9 that went away when this began.

10 Just those few numbers of people that I
11 mentioned that go out there to climb, that's just one
12 group -- one user group of the recreational side, not
13 to mention all the other important people, that people
14 have talked about today, the pollution, the sacred
15 land, what have you.

16 But the one thing that I think I would
17 like to mention, is having been a Marine, I kind of
18 think about things, like World War II. We sent someone
19 we were having a trade war with metal. We sent metal
20 to Japan and it came back to us on December 7th, 1941.
21 We're having a trade war with China. From what I
22 understand, we're going to be selling 40 percent of
23 this copper to China. We make it 100 percent back,
24 nice EBMs, total missiles and what have you. I think
25 this a bad idea.

1 TIMOTHY WIGHT: Hello. My name's Timothy
2 Wight, T-i-m-o-t-h-y W-i-g-h-t.

3 I would like to speak on just behalf of
4 one subject is the motorized recreation. I know
5 there's a lot of other concerns, but this has not yet
6 been addressed.

7 South of -- coming out of Oak Flats, there
8 is one fairly technical trail that goes out of forest
9 land into state land and that will be cut off in this
10 proposal, as well as on the other side of Devil's
11 Canyon, there's another trail that goes out the
12 National Forest lands that will be covered by the
13 tailings pond. I understand that there will be
14 mitigations over by Picket Post, but it still takes
15 traditional trails for motorized recreation away that
16 is quite technical and it's useful.

17 I don't understand why they can't find a
18 way to mitigate the openings of the trail heads around
19 the perimeter of the Oak Flats area. I do understand
20 that if Alternative 6 goes through, that that will take
21 care of the trail coming out of Devil's Canyon.

22 I would speak against, I think it's going
23 to be Alternative 2 and 3, if they put the tailings
24 pond over by Montana Mountain that would cause a lot
25 more problems to motorized recreation for Montana

1 Mountain Loop. But I do think that there can be some
2 mitigations to keep some of the trails open.

3 As for the other issues, it's already been
4 stated. There is no reason to go over. And I'm pretty
5 sure that we all know that the mine is pretty much a
6 done deal. It's going to go in. So now we have to try
7 to figure out ways to mitigate our issues because I
8 don't think we're going to be able to stop it.

9 KATHY MOHR-ALMEIDA: Good evening. My
10 name is Kathy Mohr-Almeida, Kathy with K, M-o-h-r,
11 hyphen, A-l-m-e-i-d, as in delightful, a.

12 I don't think Arizona can afford this
13 mine. We can't afford the water. What happens when
14 our water becomes so scarce that these tailings piles
15 dries up? There's going to be a haboob and it's going
16 to carry all that toxic material into the city. It's
17 not good. We can't afford the water.

18 The other thing is the carbon footprint of
19 this project is going to be very significant. We can't
20 afford more dirt in the air.

21 And then I would like to ask what price
22 can you put on the beauty that is Oak Flat? It's a
23 very special place to me. I do a lot of recreating up
24 there. It's a really beautiful place. And it would be
25 just a loss of a lot treasure for Arizona if we go

1 forward with this mine.

2 Thank you.

3 MARK HORLINGS: Good evening. I'm Mark
4 Horlings, M-a-r-k H-o-r-l-i-n-g-s. I'm conservation
5 chair of the Maricopa Audubon Society. The Maricopa
6 Audubon has opposed this project since the early the
7 2000s, both on the merits and because the land exchange
8 legislation, it's clearly an attempt to evade
9 environmental protections.

10 We only have three minutes, so I'm going
11 to focus on one very tiny issue. Are the figures for
12 water quantity use in the draft statement realistic?
13 I've been trying to understand the water calculations,
14 then you realize that the statement includes only net
15 figures. You cannot tell how much water is going to be
16 used to do the mining. How much is going to be used to
17 do the processing. How much is going to be used to
18 slurry the waste down to the tailings pond.

19 We're assured that Resolution Copper is
20 going to work hard to reuse their water and so they
21 have these net figures. But are those realistic?

22 The Arizona mines and mining department
23 did a study about 10 years ago of actual water use in
24 copper mines and they found that they're using about
25 ten times as much water per pound of copper produced as

1 this draft statement anticipates. There are other
2 studies based on actual mines around the world that
3 indicate that this mine's -- or the figures that are in
4 the draft statement are about three times too low. The
5 mine is, in other words, going to need at least three
6 times as much water.

7 And then when you look at some of the
8 specifics, you find, again, that there's an
9 understatement of the water that's going to be used and
10 the principle one, this is disclosed in the statement,
11 but the principle one is that the shafts are already
12 acting as wells and the water that has to be removed
13 from the shafts, and this 87,000 acre feet over the
14 life of the mine, the water that has to be removed is
15 not being counted as a use of the water.

16 Well, right now that water goes down to
17 Apache Junction and is used for agriculture. So if
18 it's not adding to the supply, it's going to increase
19 the demand when the mine comes in.

20 And I think if you look at those kind of
21 figures, you'll see that the estimates in this draft
22 statement are simply not realistic. And let me say
23 quickly, I always like to say, save the best for last.
24 I have to stop after three minutes, so just remember, I
25 had even better points that you haven't heard.

1 ESTEBAN LOPEZ: (Speaking Native
2 language.) Esteban Lopez. I'm Akimel O'odham, from
3 the Salt River -- an enrolled community member of the
4 Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community. I'm 30
5 years old. I've lived here all my life. I'm married
6 to Selena Lopez. She's Apache. We have three
7 daughters.

8 What I wanted to say was that just this
9 past year in June, we had a -- a sunrise ceremony for
10 my oldest daughter. And I'm not Apache at all, so
11 going through that phase, it was really uplifting. And
12 knowing that her land was built there. She made her
13 home there. We visit it every time we go, we visit her
14 home.

15 And I, again, have two other daughters and
16 they state they want to have their ceremonies there
17 too. So how is that going to happen if it's gone? All
18 the traditional songs and the teachings, it's all in
19 our songs, the place is there. It's described -- we're
20 there. So when you hear it and you step foot on there,
21 you see it. And you also have that holy connection
22 with it.

23 So moving forward, I know that in my
24 culture, in O'odhams, O'odhams go all the way from --
25 here from Salt River all the way to Tohono O'odham, to

1 TO, going down towards the border. All these, the
2 songs, the teachings and all that, it's in our songs
3 too. Oak Flat is a sacred and holy place. We're not
4 making none of this stuff up. I can get the song for
5 you. I can sing it for you, if you need me to and I
6 can explain it to you. But it is our home. It belongs
7 to our children, to my grandchildren. What are we
8 leaving for them?

9 Because when it's gone, what do I tell my
10 daughters? She's five years old and she has that
11 connection to that place. This is not right, at all.
12 It can't happen. The further we go with this, it's
13 only a -- an immorally reminder to all just Native
14 Americans in general that you guys just take stuff from
15 us. And it's hard to see that and it's hard to live
16 through that.

17 So, yeah, I'm 30 years old and my
18 daughter, she's five. I'm going to have grandchildren.
19 When we sing the songs to them, when we tell them about
20 our teachings, what does she got to look forward to?
21 What's going to be left? This needs to stop. Oak Flat
22 is our home.

23 And -- sorry, I lost my train of thought.
24 But I just -- I really -- you know, I'm -- like I say,
25 I'm not even Apache. I'm Native. But I'm not Apache

1 and I know that this wrong. You don't have to be
2 Native American to know that this is not right, that
3 this needs to stop now.

4 Thank you.

5 ROGER FEATHERSTONE: Hi. I'm Roger
6 Featherstone, R-o-g-e-r F-e-a-t-h-e-r-s-t-o-n-e. I'm
7 director of the Arizona Mine and Reform Coalition.

8 Our coalition is not anti-mining, but we
9 are anti-stupidity. And this project is a fatally
10 flawed experiment. And, frankly, we would be doing Rio
11 Tinto and BHP a favor when we stop this thing. For all
12 of you that say this is a done deal, it's not. This is
13 a technologically -- this is not technologically
14 possible, what they're planning on doing. And our
15 comments, which will be submitted at the end, our
16 written comments, will prove that up.

17 There's not enough water for this project.
18 This project would use as much water as the city of --
19 more water than the City of Tempe uses. And do we in
20 Arizona here have the luxury of giving water to a
21 foreign mining company to send ore to China when we
22 don't have enough water for our cities and our
23 communities and our agriculture and the environment.

24 Somebody said that we need the mine here
25 in the U.S. because we have the best mining laws in the

1 world. I'm sorry, we don't. As a matter of fact, all
2 of the tailings alternatives listed in the DEIS are
3 illegal in the third world countries of Brazil and
4 Chile. And they're also illegal in the United States.

5 So how is that we're saying we've got to
6 destroy the sacred place of Oak Flat, we've got to
7 destroy 16,000 acres for the profits of two foreign
8 mining companies to avoid mining in another country?
9 That just didn't make any sense.

10 Rio Tinto is having problems with building
11 a similar mine in Mongolia. Rio Tinto has stated --
12 their high top brass have stated they're putting this
13 project on the back burner to develop other projects in
14 Australia and the one in Mongolia. So for you guys to
15 think this is going to be a panacea for your profit
16 margin, this company is not even likely to stay around.
17 So we just need to end this now, as been said.

18 I want to thank the folks that have set up
19 all these meetings. They've been hard, they've gone
20 well and I appreciate that. And, lastly, I just want
21 to give the Forest Service -- we had a meeting in
22 Tucson last night where some people handwrote comment
23 letters.

24 And I just want to leave these with Tom.

25 Thank you.

1 MANUEL PINO: Manuel Pino,
2 M-a-n-u-e-l P-i-n-o. (Speaking Native language.)

3 I would like to share a history of
4 uranium -- of mining in the Southwest that goes beyond
5 copper. I am from Acoma Pueblo in New Mexico. We have
6 been fighting an 80-year legacy of the uranium mining
7 ever since the 1940s when the ore from the Navajo
8 Nation and up in the northwest territories of Canada
9 was used to make the weapons of mass destruction that
10 were used at the Hiroshima and Nagasaki.

11 We in Acoma, Laguna and the Navajo Nation
12 have experienced the mining industry, like I said, for
13 over 80 years. We have lived this negative legacy.
14 And passing legislation in the midnight hour is not the
15 trust responsibility of the United States government
16 and how it should be upheld. That is a violation of
17 our human rights. That is a violation of our free and
18 part of informed consent of the Apache Nation and all
19 the other indigenous nations that consider Oak Flat
20 sacred.

21 We have visited -- this is like deja vu
22 all over again. Sitting in the courtroom and the
23 hearing rooms regarding the Snowbowl up at San
24 Francisco Peaks (speaking Native language). And,
25 again, the U.S. Forest Service informed [sic] on the

1 sacredness of our (speaking Native language), as we
2 know San Francisco Peaks.

3 What does it take to convince the
4 decision-makers that our spirituality, our connection,
5 the rights of Mother Earth are real? Who speaks for
6 the water? Who speaks for the animals that are going
7 to be impacted by this process? Who speaks for the
8 land, the air? The dominant society doesn't consider
9 these measurements.

10 Listening to, again, from back home, we're
11 having to consider the Cibola National Forest
12 management plan that is accommodating initiatives
13 towards restarting uranium mining. We have over
14 thousand abandoned uranium mines on the Navajo Nation
15 that have not been reclaimed. So how can we believe
16 that this is safe mining in Southern Arizona?

17 I don't believe it. I've lived it. Those
18 of you that are workers, that are advocating on behalf
19 of this industry, the day before yesterday in
20 Albuquerque we had hearings, Congressional hearings
21 conducted by Senator Udall. And, again, the Radiation
22 Exposure Compensation Act -- I don't know how you put a
23 dollar value on human life, but that's what we're
24 afforded as compensation for all our ancestors, three
25 of my uncles included, who have died of cancer. That

1 is not justice. That is environment racism and that is
2 environment injustice.

3 And if you want to -- and if you want
4 documentation, just visit EPA Region 6, EPA Region 9
5 for the testimonies of those workers, who have given
6 their lives for this industry. Consider that for
7 everyone in the room, who might have a living relative
8 who will be negatively impacted for this industry.

9 (Speaking Native language.) Thank you for
10 your time.

11 LAURA MEDINA: I do acknowledge that we're
12 on unseated O'odham territory.

13 My name is Laura Medina. The spelling is
14 L-a-u-r-a M-e-d-i-n-a. I'm obviously against the --
15 this project, in general. As an indigenous woman, as
16 an indigenous mother, who is bringing -- who is
17 birthing the next generation into existence, I and my
18 son are primary stakeholders. Do you understand that?

19 If this project goes through, you all are
20 committing and allowing the continued genocide to take
21 place, continued genocide, meaning that it has never
22 gone, has never stopped. Especially with the missing
23 and murdered indigenous women. Especially with all the
24 mines and all of the extraction places that are taking
25 place and mine camps are being set up. And our woman

1 and our children and our elders are being disrespected
2 on a continued basis because colonization still
3 continues. Colonization has never ended.

4 You have no room to disagree with us. You
5 have no room. Absolutely no room. This is like my
6 sister said before me, our lives are at stake. I mean,
7 you guys probably all think they're building some type
8 of spaceship to take you to another earth, but that
9 doesn't exist right and it's not going to exist.

10 And that's the reason why you continue to
11 allow all these construction sites to take place, while
12 the working class is being placed in the middle, as if
13 you're doing us a favor for them. That's not right.
14 That's inhumane right there. Because there's jobs out
15 there that can exist without the mine. We don't need
16 another mine.

17 When ASU is decorating their buildings
18 with copper, they're decorating. They use it as a
19 decoration. We don't need more copper. If you want
20 more copper, how about you start giving money to the
21 African nation who is taking our electronic waste and
22 how about you start reusing the mines and the minerals
23 that are being extracted out of that country.

24 You all have continued the genocide for
25 far too long. And as a woman, who has inherent power,

1 because I give birth. You all don't. You don't hold
2 this foundation. You all ripped it and stole it from
3 us. You raped my ancestors. You killed my
4 grandfathers and you continue this destruction, with
5 little or no consideration of the indigenous people.

6 I am going to put a stop to this. This is
7 not going to happen. Your hotels, your jobs, your
8 economics is not a vital means for allowing the death
9 to happen. Do you really want to be on the wrong side
10 of history? Do you really want to continue having
11 blood on your hands?

12 My son means more to me than your money.
13 It means more to me than this mine. And I guarantee
14 that every mother understands that importance. And for
15 that gentleman who likes to use his grandchildren,
16 shame on you. This is for them as much as it is for
17 you.

18 (Speaking Native language.)

19 STEVE TRUSSELL: Steve Trussell, S-t-e-v-e
20 T-r-u-s-s-e-l-l.

21 The U.S. Forest Service deserves
22 tremendous credit for the work they've put into this
23 Draft EIS. The process has reached unprecedented
24 levels of engagement and transparency. That is a
25 testament to the way the process is being conducted, as

1 well as the exceptional operator Resolution Copper is.

2 The impressive mitigations being committed
3 to the DEIS will be a significant benefit to the local
4 communities. These include a ten to one mitigation
5 ratio, related to impacts on recreational trails at Oak
6 Flat, like pairing enhancement and restoration decades
7 before any impacts. Providing a replacement camp
8 ground and retaining access to the existing camp ground
9 and a new boulder area called Inconceivable, while also
10 keeping several traditional and sports climbing areas
11 untouched and available for continued public enjoyment.

12 As a climber, myself, I was impressed to
13 learn that the company has partnered with REI providing
14 access to climbing areas where instructors can teach
15 the next generation of recreational climbers.

16 Anyone who knows Conrad Anker -- well, if
17 you don't, you're not a climber. But if you do, you
18 know that he has also appreciated the mining industry.
19 And has actually said thank you for the things you
20 provide so I can go and do what I enjoy.

21 Resolution Copper is also a tremendous
22 community partner, as it relates to helping diversity
23 and diversifying local economies and enhancing
24 sustainable communities. They're funding an incubator
25 and entrepreneurship center in Superior to develop

1 local small business. They provide \$1.2 million to the
2 Superior School District and will modernize classrooms
3 and enhance curriculum. And they are partnering with
4 nonprofits to address local blight issues as well.

5 It is for these reasons and many more that
6 I support the DEIS and this vital project. I would
7 like to remind you that we are very fortunate to have
8 such a wonderful mineral endowment in this great state.
9 If can't be grown, it must be mined. And I notice that
10 a lot of you have devices and so forth that you enjoy
11 that come from these mine products.

12 Arizona is number two in production of
13 minerals in the nation and, additionally, we are the
14 number one copper producer in the U.S., providing 68
15 percent of the nation's copper. There are
16 approximately 60,000 jobs created by all mining
17 industry subsidiaries in Arizona, thanks in part to
18 opportunity projects like this.

19 Today we mine exponentially more copper
20 due to the increased demand. This is due to the fact
21 that it is a key metal necessary for renewable energy
22 initiatives, healthcare and technological advancements
23 we have come to rely on. These materials are also
24 critical for our nation's defense and quite, frankly,
25 our future.

1 Thanks.

2 HANNAH BERCOVICI: Thank you. I'm Hannah
3 Bercovici, H-a-n-n-a-h B-e-r-c, as in Charles, o-v, as
4 in Victor, i-c, as in Charles, -i. My last name is
5 pretty difficult.

6 Okay. So I am from the Arizona Science
7 Policy Network. We are a grassroots organization of
8 early career scientists. I'm a geologist and we are
9 opposed to this mine. And the reason that we are
10 opposed -- there's many reasons that everybody has come
11 up here and talked about tonight, but the one I'm going
12 to talk about, as I am a scientist, is scientific
13 integrity.

14 If we look at the project, you can tell
15 that there is lack of integrity of scientific integrity
16 here. For example, not this scientific integrity, but
17 your example of REI supporting this, I am simplifying
18 that, I Googled in relation to this mine and nothing
19 came up. So I don't believe that.

20 So this needs a lot more scientific
21 integrity to actually be something that's acceptable.
22 Also, it's just not acceptable because this is going to
23 be damaging Native lands. I can just read off the back
24 of this postcard a lot of reasons why we should not be
25 supporting this mine.

1 Moneywise, according to the Arizona Mining
2 Association, mining in Arizona contributes about five
3 billion dollars to the state economies, while outdoor
4 recreation contributes about 10.5 billion dollars,
5 yeah, billion dollars. So which one should we actually
6 be trying to get more of?

7 Also, I'm a climber. And as a climber you
8 can't -- I'm just going to tell you right away, you
9 can't just replace a climbing area with a new climbing
10 area because that area hasn't been -- like if you're in
11 a new climbing area, that is not safe. So you're
12 actually putting a lot of the people who are coming to
13 Arizona in danger by doing this.

14 And so if you -- another thing I would
15 like to say, so mining laws in the United States are
16 very outdated. And the mining law that currently runs
17 the mining industries in the United States was made in
18 1872. So it's been almost a 150 years since we've
19 reformed anything.

20 And so if you want to -- so we have a
21 representative from Arizona, Representative Grijalva in
22 the House and he is trying to reform the 1872 mining
23 law, to actually be considerate of people rather than
24 just allowing the companies come in and do whatever
25 they want.

1 So if you are supportive of this, the
2 Arizona Science Policy Network, we have created these
3 postcards and you can send to a representative of your
4 choice. So our recommendation is Grijalva, if you want
5 to support him or Kyrsten Sinema and tell her to
6 actually have an opinion about this.

7 So if you are interested, I have a bunch
8 and they are stamped and you can write down your own
9 personal story and you can -- and you want to make sure
10 they've actually gotten -- okay. I'm done.

11 So if you want some, let me know. I have
12 a bunch. Thank you.

13 ANNA JEFFREY: Anna Jeffrey,
14 A-n-n-a J-e-f-f-r-e-y.

15 A lot of you already know, I'm from
16 Superior. I was born and raised there. And I do not
17 want this in my backyard. Not only because it's my
18 backyard, because it's a very sacred place to me and it
19 really is my church. It is. It's my church. And this
20 is one thing that has not been addressed in any of this
21 these books, four books. This thick (indicating) that
22 I got, like, two weeks before the first meeting. So
23 I'm supposed to know what to tell you all.

24 Well, I do know quite a bit about the mine
25 because I've lived there all my life and I was there

1 from the get-go. I know that there is fault line that
2 runs east and west towards Apache Leap Mountain down to
3 Cross Canyon, right up to my backyard, you know. And
4 they say, oh, they're going to put a tunnel to keep
5 that from breaching Apache Leap. Well, I don't think
6 that's going to help. And, besides, not only that I'm
7 not sure what they mean by tunnel. They have all of
8 the drill rigs that are pretty much on the peripheral
9 area of the subsidence.

10 Some of the best most beautiful areas of
11 Oak Flat is in the middle of the subsidence zone.
12 That's where the petroglyphs are. That's where the
13 springs are. There's literally rocks that defy gravity
14 balancing on cliffs and it's just amazing. A lot of
15 you know, you guys know, Manny knows, you know, we all
16 know what's at stake here. And it's a bad, bad thing.
17 I'm already watching how the desert is drying up and
18 dying and how the animals aren't there anymore. And I
19 know because I'm from there, so I see it.

20 You know, I said before it is my church.
21 I go up and there and I pray. I pray for the holy
22 ground. I actually prayed for a family member who was
23 heavily addicted to drugs and I prayed hard for him to
24 come up there and he's completely drug free now.
25 You know, miracles happen there. So many people I know

1 go up there and they just leave their worries there and
2 they're blessed and that's what this place is.

3 And you guys have not even addressed that
4 at all and Neil should be here. And Neil was there.
5 He saw the crosses. He was there when we put the holy
6 ground up. And, you know, he's disrespecting this by
7 not addressing -- not even putting up a fight to
8 address this, that it is a sacred place. And I'm a
9 white girl and it's sacred to me. You know, it's my
10 church. It's always been my church.

11 So there.

12 SANDRA RAMBLER: (Speaking
13 Native language.)

14 This is my daughter (speaking Native
15 language). She died in Washington D.C. (Speaking
16 Native language). Oak Flat (Speaking Native language).

17 This is my daughter. I wish she was
18 here with me today. She was one of our very strong
19 advocates. From the time she was little and small, she
20 went with us to Oak Flat. My children grew up at Oak
21 Flat. My granddaughter had a ceremony at Oak Flat.
22 I'm really (unintelligible) going to continue -- you
23 cannot replace Oak Flat. You cannot replace our sacred
24 ground and put it somewhere else. You can't do that.
25 And that area there has Apache names because our people

1 dwelled in that whole area.

2 My grandparents are buried there. What
3 are you going to do? Are you going to take them and
4 take their remains and remove them? It just breaks my
5 heart and my spirit. And shame on the people that are
6 supporting it. Shame on the people that
7 (unintelligible) Resolution Copper.

8 You don't mess with this medicine. This
9 is what we get there. This is what we use for our
10 ceremonies. It's called (unintelligible). This is
11 what we use to pray with and we put it in our pouch.
12 And this is a feather that comes from the eagles that
13 fly over Oak Flat. Now when there's a giant hole in
14 there, is there going to be any eagles feathers
15 (unintelligible)?

16 My granddaughter had her ceremony there,
17 like I said, and I have other grandchildren that want
18 to have their ceremonies there. We're preparing for
19 one now. What guarantee do I have that she's going to
20 have here ceremony there? There's no assurance. For
21 500 years our people have suffered. And I'm speaking
22 for the water. I come from (speaking Native language)
23 tribe, the (unintelligible) water people. Our people
24 were born to protect the water. And Arizona is already
25 dry. We can't afford this.

1 Resolution Copper is going to benefit \$130
2 billion. Let them go somewhere else. We don't want
3 them here. And thank you helping us support Oak Flat.
4 And when they come, I will be there in my traditional
5 clothes. They can bulldoze over me with my medicine
6 because I'm not going to let them do it.

7 Thank you.

8 MARK DAVIS: Hello, everyone. My name is
9 Mark Davis, M-a-r-k D-a-v, as in victory, -i-s.

10 Well, I did a little bit of thinking about
11 this and I wanted to make some comments. I would like
12 to thank the Forest Service for the time and care
13 they've taken in the DEIS process. Thank you for your
14 thoroughness and your hard work.

15 I've spent my career in mining and I see
16 the mining industry going above and beyond to protect
17 our environment every day. As an engineer, I can say
18 that the plan proposed by Resolution is sound. It
19 meets and exceeds industry standards and gives us the
20 clean copper we need for the future in a safe
21 responsible manner. If we want to turn the dream of
22 clean energy into reality, we need copper. Copper must
23 be mined. It can't be grown and we recycle it as
24 effectively or more effectively than any other metal
25 currently, so we need more of it.

1 Your cell phones, your Teslas, your solar
2 panels, your clean water all need copper. The small
3 local business I work for has added jobs in Arizona in
4 the last few months just because of Resolution Copper.
5 They're already hiring people and these are good jobs,
6 20- to \$30 an hour, full benefits and 401K. They're
7 careers. They're places in jobs that you can use to
8 make a life. We will add many more jobs when the mine
9 is built and becomes active. These people will buy
10 homes, stay in hotels and pay taxes all here in
11 Arizona.

12 I ask you to look at the facts around
13 Resolution and not the fears. Mines like Resolution
14 are our key to a green, secure and prosperous future.

15 Thank you.

16 ROY CHAVEZ: Now, the other side of the
17 story, the truth.

18 My name is Roy Chavez, R-o-y C-h-a-v, as
19 in Victor, e-z.

20 I am a third generation life-long resident
21 of Superior, Arizona. I've served the community as
22 mayor. I served the community as town manager. In
23 fact, it was about 21, 22 years ago, I see a friend of
24 mine, Ron (unintelligible). He's a consultant for PEG
25 here in Phoenix. He was the first primary consultant

1 that Rio Tinto brought to the table.

2 I closed the mine in 1996. I was an
3 underground miner. And I worked also in the '70s when
4 you could as a young man make a good living in the
5 mine. I graduated from ASU with the money that I made
6 and I've gone on to serve. I was mayor of Superior, as
7 I said, town manager. I ran for county supervisor.
8 I've been opposed to this project since day one.

9 They came into town back in '98 when I was
10 mayor. We had just closed the mine in '96. In '82 the
11 mine closed the first time. They laid off 1,400
12 people. They reopened the new mine with 400 people,
13 less than 70 of us were from Superior. Let me tell you
14 something, there's not one penny that comes in direct
15 taxes to any community in these mining towns. Not one
16 penny in direct taxes. The formula for the tax base
17 revenue that's generated for the mining industry is
18 based on population. It all goes down to the great
19 state [sic] of Phoenix and then it's split up by the 92
20 towns, including the towns and cities and the 15
21 counties, by population.

22 We've got about 2,200 people in Superior.
23 There's about -- there's less than that in Miami. Less
24 than that in Kearny and Winkelman. Let me tell you
25 something, anybody that believes the mining industry is

1 vital to these towns is ridiculous. You're totally
2 misconstrued. Show me a mining town anywhere that is a
3 success with an active mine. You know what two mining
4 towns is successful in Arizona, Bisbee, Arizona, and
5 Jerome, because they ain't got no mines.

6 I had something else to talk about, but
7 let me share what somebody has said about the
8 communities. Recreation brings in almost twice as much
9 money in billions of dollars annually to the state's
10 revenues and incomes. That's a fact. That's a fact
11 from the mining industry.

12 But let me say this, as we speak, as I
13 speak right now, we talk about jobs, labor, good things
14 for employees, because of the technology that's going
15 to be needed at this depth, I mined there, I came out
16 of there at 3,750 last night. The point being is at
17 7,000 I went down too. They tried to take me down to
18 convince me that this great shaft project is
19 unbelievable. It's unbelievable, but it's unbelievably
20 hot.

21 The reality here is that it will be
22 antonymous, robotic. And so those jobs will be
23 supplied by antonymous robotic mining. That's a fact.
24 That's in their mining plan.

25 Let me finish with this, we have three Cs,

1 cattle, cotton and copper for the state of Arizona.
2 We've added two more citrus and climate. I've added
3 two more, corruption and cash.

4 LESLIE GLASS: I'm Leslie Glass,
5 L-e-s-l-i-e G-l-a-s-s.

6 I have attended every one of the public
7 hearings that has been held. I did request a meeting
8 in Tucson but they wouldn't have it, so here I am
9 again. I am not quite as nervous as I was before, but
10 I do not like to speak in public.

11 However, I want to open with Tuesday night
12 in Queen Valley, I couldn't speak. I sat in the front
13 row and I cried throughout the whole entire -- every
14 one of the testimonies. It broke my heart to pieces.

15 Today I want to open with a little humor
16 from my dad to help me get me through what I would like
17 to say. And pardon me, Wendsler.

18 "If you can't dazzle them with brilliance,
19 baffle them with bullshit." Every time I pick up the
20 DEIS and every time I read it, and I'm a fairly
21 intelligent woman, I am astounded and baffled by the
22 bullshit.

23 And what makes me so angry -- I'm very
24 angry right now -- is that land exchange. And that is
25 equally as baffling. The only option that there is is

1 the no build alternative. And the only other option is
2 to support the Save Oak Flat Act. We've got a bill in
3 the House and a bill in the Senate. We have to repeal
4 the land exchange and stop this mine.

5 I've got another minute. I would like to
6 talk about the archeological sites. There are 721
7 archeological sites that have been recorded. 523 of
8 them are determined or recommended for eligibility to
9 the National Registry of Historical Properties.

10 In the last meeting, where I was at in
11 Queen Valley, one of the gentleman who lived there, he
12 was glad that Alternative 6, Skunk Camp was chosen as
13 an alternative tailings location. And I would like to
14 state that there are 323 archeological sites that would
15 be impacted in Skunk Camp. And his reason that he was
16 glad was because of his golf course. That makes me
17 angry. Especially when the full impacts, even though
18 the trouble monitor study is ongoing for Skunk Camp
19 tailings site the full impacts are not known and no
20 tribe supports this desecration.

21 The DEIS was released prematurely and I
22 understand the Southeastern Arizona land exchange was
23 written to be expedited -- and I know you turned off my
24 microphone, but I'm gong to finish what I have to say.

25 SOUND TECHNICIAN: Nothing's off.

1 LESLIE GLASS: Shortcuts were taken to
2 expedite the land exchange and regardless of the
3 results of the environmental impact study and
4 regardless it doesn't stop the land exchange and it
5 goes into public -- or private ownership and they are
6 exempt from all laws that offer protection and I'm
7 angry.

8 I'm sorry. I overstepped my boundaries.

9 WENDSLER NOSIE, SENIOR: My name is
10 Wendsler Nosie, Senior, W-e-n-d-s-l-e-r N-o-s-i-e.

11 Just to fit in within my three minutes.

12 Tom, first of all, I submitted to
13 Mr. Bosworth our statement from the Stronghold and I'm
14 also going to give this to you, but with the hopes that
15 you take Cal Joyner, who is the Southwest Regional.

16 And in those documents you're going to
17 find what was totally missed when it comes to the
18 sacred and ceremony and the people's religion. You
19 know, what you people all need to understand out there
20 is that we have religion just like you do, no
21 different. We pray to one God. And what is at stake
22 is our religion. Now, I can't understand how you can
23 live with that. I can't. When America claims that you
24 came here for freedom of religion. And to allow this
25 to be attacked now.

1 Go back to what a lot of the people said
2 is that if NEPA was done, we would never be here
3 tonight. And for the tribes, the 22 tribes in Arizona
4 they've laid down their last card and trusted the
5 United States and said, we want to follow NEPA because
6 NEPA would have exposed all of this information that we
7 are exposing right now.

8 So go back to Rick Ramsey. Rick Ramsey is
9 the one that came to San Carlos and told us that this
10 is bad deal because there's a lot of parties involved.
11 There's foreign people, so many percentages are going
12 to leave America, and it's comical. They go, Nosie --
13 Chairman Nosie, you guys can win this. If you can make
14 the people of Arizona and this country stand up, then
15 this will be exposed, the evil will be exposed.

16 And the one thing I would like to say for
17 the Native people and unity for all of us, you know, we
18 say we want to decolonize. Well, what we mean by that
19 is what corporations have done to our people. What we
20 see, the magnitude of what is brought to here. So with
21 those who are supporting this mine, you're with the
22 same corporation trying to kill your community, trying
23 to kill you as a people.

24 So we are not angry at the white people.
25 We're angry about what came across in what was evil

1 with greed and that's colonization. This is all we've
2 got left as people of this country. So I know that
3 you're probably going to make your decision in moving
4 forward, so we have to pay our attention to the people
5 in Congress. We have to start hitting them hard. And
6 last but not least, like I said in the last meeting at
7 Queen Valley, in Apache we have (Singing Native
8 language).

9 When our people were brought as prisoners
10 of war they cried for one day when we will return home
11 and this is what America had promised us. When you
12 become civilized, you will get back these areas that
13 are important for you. Well, you know what, that never
14 happened. But I'm going to tell you like I told the
15 people in Queen Valley, when you see the change, when
16 the cool wind of winter comes in, I'm going home. I
17 don't care what these guys are going to do, Resolution
18 Copper is going to do. Because I am going home. As it
19 was told and as it was promised in the prophecy in what
20 is spiritual.

21 Thank you.

22 JIM DUBLINSKI: Hello. My name is Jim
23 Dublinski, D-u-b-l-i-n-s-k-i.

24 First of all, I want to thank you for
25 bringing this to Phoenix. On short notice to get such

1 a crowd like this, I think is pretty notable and I
2 think you hear a lot of the emotion in the room.

3 The Tonto is one of the most visited
4 national forests in the country. It's a special place.
5 Oak Flat is unique. As a climber, Oak Flat is
6 important. The rec economy we talked about 10 billion,
7 it's actually 20 billion. It's much bigger than is
8 mining and extraction.

9 So what I would really ask you to do is
10 look at the numbers on one side but the cultural
11 resources, the spiritual, the religious significance is
12 priceless and that's something you can't check off a
13 box on.

14 As you look at the environmental and
15 ecological impact on the area, it's really a health
16 issue. What can happen? The what-if scenarios is
17 critical. And I just don't want to understate the fact
18 that you heard a couple of times the water consumption
19 used in this area is really understated. Far smarter
20 people than I have addressed that. But, I mean, you've
21 looked at the numbers, it doesn't add up and the
22 significance to other agriculture and other -- the
23 recharge, having to use Tempe's water supply is just
24 crazy because we live in the desert. We're in a
25 drought.

1 So alls I can say is water is life. The
2 Tonto initially is a national forest. It's established
3 because of its water shed. And I ask you to please
4 listen to the stories here over the corporate
5 interests.

6 Thank you.

7 JESSICA MILNES: Jessica Milnes,
8 J-e-s-s-i-c-a M-i-l-n-e-s.

9 So I'm a neutral perspective, kind of in
10 between both. Part -- about 80 percent of what I do
11 for work is concrete and it comes from the mining
12 industry. So I'm very supportive of the mining
13 industry. But at the same time, I'm also a mother,
14 whose daughter hunts on that land. She's part of your
15 Arizona Junior Olympics shooting team and she hunts
16 there.

17 And where I find myself of being a big
18 supporter of the mine and also of land preservation,
19 doing the right thing is somewhere in the middle. I
20 appreciate every single one of you for showing up here
21 tonight. That you're passionate one side or the other,
22 but that everyone can come into this room and speak
23 candidly for what they believe in and how they feel and
24 how they see it. And we've done it with respect and
25 kindness to one another.

1 For me, it's hard -- if you stood up here,
2 it's hard to put everything into the words. I support
3 the Forest Service and what decisions you guys make.
4 What you make. What you make. What you make. And the
5 time and the attention that goes into these mine sites.
6 I love that we're in a county that maybe we're not the
7 best yet, but if we continue to support the mining
8 industry and we have meetings like this where we can
9 voice our concerns of the things that aren't
10 necessarily right or going in the right direction in
11 the mining industry, that we can make changes.

12 Because, like I said, I work in concrete.
13 In the last year we passed laws where our men and women
14 are more protected from respirable crystalline silica
15 than ever before. And that comes from people standing
16 up and saying this is what I believe and why I believe
17 it. And it comes from the mining industry coming
18 together listening and adapting our policies and
19 procedures in order to make it as safe and economical
20 and all of those things as possible.

21 So on this mine in particular, it has
22 nothing do with me per se as work goes. It has
23 something to do with me as a mother whose daughter goes
24 out there and spends time. But I just really
25 appreciate the time and the attention that has been put

1 into it and the attempt to hear everyone's side. And I
2 appreciate everyone that showed up here, whether you
3 are for mining, like I am or you're totally against it,
4 I love that you guys walked into this room and that you
5 sat down and you voiced your voice.

6 So thank you.

7 RYAN CHAMBERLIN: Ryan Chamberlin, R-y-a-n
8 C-h-a-m-b-e-r-l-i-n.

9 I didn't come prepared with a speech so
10 I'll tell you a story that means a lot to me.

11 I grew up in North Central Arizona on a
12 cattle ranch and I've watched that land dry. There
13 used to be a stream that ran all year round -- or the
14 creek rather and springs, they both dried up. When I
15 was 17, I was lucky enough to turn that year in a
16 wilderness program that was run by a Native man named
17 Ezekiel Anansi, because I was sick from the greed that
18 we are fighting today.

19 I forgot about that. I went back to sleep
20 and I operated heavy equipment from 20 to 25. And I
21 bet if this guy did a little thinking over here, he
22 could find another job, like I did. It breaks my
23 heart. I saw the hole, as a climber, a mountain biker,
24 a kayaker, a runner, a hiker, a backpacker, a camper,
25 somebody who sleeps under the stars out there. It

1 breaks my heart to see what's going to happen. I
2 almost cried.

3 I've walked Devil's Canyon. I've walked
4 Hackberry Creek. I know the canyon trees. I know the
5 birds. Just because I'm a white guy doesn't mean that
6 that's not my church, it's not my spirituality, it's
7 not religion.

8 And, furthermore, if these two gentlemen
9 were still sitting here, I would love to tell them how
10 they should read some history books about what has
11 happened to the Apaches. And they could start with one
12 called "Watch for Me on the Mountain."

13 We keep taking and taking and taking from
14 these people, and saying, "Oh, we'll just move this
15 over here," like the reservations or the climbing
16 areas. When is it going to stop? Never? Because
17 greed doesn't end, right? It's a sickness. It's like
18 a disease. It's like cancer.

19 That dude is not a climber and him picking
20 Conrad Anker's name made me sick. A wolf in sheep's
21 clothing, that's what politics are.

22 Everybody has talked about the money in
23 recreation. I'm just going to hit that drum one more
24 time. There's not only more money happening right now,
25 but as we know as climbers, it's exploding right now

1 because of movies like Alex Honnold and whatnot.
2 Mountain biking is exploding. So that dollar value is
3 going to continue to grow and grow. Whereas, this
4 \$3,700 job or jobs is going to go away.

5 And, furthermore, as a kayaker who's ran
6 the Salt, there is not -- so ten times more water is an
7 accurate number than what's realistic, that's 5 million
8 square acres. That's more than half the state in
9 water. And the Salt doesn't even run year round
10 anymore, only when it floods, that's it and then it
11 dries back up.

12 DR. LIAN BIGHORSE: (Speaking Native
13 language.) Dr. Lian Bighorse (speaking Native
14 language) San Carlos (speaking Native language).

15 Hello. My name is Dr. Lian Bighorse,
16 L-i-a-n B-i-g-h-o-r-s-e.

17 This is my daughter Soliel. And so it's
18 hard to stand up here and be calm and talk about how
19 important Oak Flat is to me and my family. My kids are
20 here. And I have brought my kids to every public
21 hearing I can bring them to because it deeply impacts
22 them. It impacts their future. My daughter, she's
23 nine years old. We're already planning to have her
24 sunrise dance at Oak Flat because that's where she
25 wants it. That's where she told me she wanted to have

1 her ceremony.

2 And I'm scared. I'm scared if Oak Flat is
3 still going to be there when the time comes. My
4 children -- we go to Oak Flat all the time. They know
5 Oak Flat so well, they feel good there. We can feel at
6 home. They know every inch of the effected area. And
7 I have a 11 and half year old and he was running around
8 here with his drum and he loves it there. And, you
9 know, I see some people, you know, might disagree with
10 me having my kids here. But it's their future. It's
11 their future and that's why they're here.

12 I want them to know when we get older that
13 if Oak Flat isn't there, I want them to know that me as
14 a mother that I stood up here and said how bad it was
15 wrong. That I did everything I could in my power to
16 say that it was wrong.

17 I work in public health field. The
18 impacts from this mine are going to affect our next
19 generations to come. My little daughter's
20 grandchildren will be affected by what happens at Oak
21 Flat. And if there is no water, if the water is
22 contaminated, if we -- there's places in this world
23 that don't have water and we're acting like it's just a
24 resource that we can pollute. And it's so disrespectful
25 to the land, to the people, the history of the land is

1 not even talked about in the EIS. That's traditional
2 Apache lands.

3 And I do want to acknowledge that, you
4 know, the land that we are on right now is O'odham
5 land. And I really do want to thank the O'odham that
6 are here, because that history is not being talked
7 about. The history of America is not being talked
8 about and it's completely disrespecting the next
9 generations to come. Our young people are learning a
10 colonized world and they're being swept aside. We are
11 the forgotten people of this country.

12 And I'm going to keep fighting and I'm
13 going to keep talking about how wrong this is, not only
14 for myself but for my children. (Speaking Native
15 language.)

16 MIN YVE: My name is Min, M-i-n, last
17 name, Y-v-e.

18 So I was fortunate enough to hear about
19 the crisis with Oak Flat while I was looking for a
20 place to camp for my birthday. And I was really
21 effected by it because I love animals and the
22 environment. It's really unfortunate in today's
23 society, in this day and age, with all the technology
24 that we have that we are so focused on something so
25 antiquated.

1 There are scientists and people out there
2 who can create rare gems that jewelers can't tell if
3 they came from the earth or if they were created in a
4 lab. So when you're saying that, you know, mining is
5 important, no, saving the planet is important. So
6 instead of putting your money -- instead of putting
7 your money towards something that is so outdated and
8 that has a desecrating effect on nonrenewable
9 resources, you should probably -- I recommend
10 considering putting your money towards things like
11 cleaning up the ocean or developing housing for people
12 in need. Something that is not going to create a big
13 hole.

14 Because I'm actually from Bisbee. I
15 traveled around that pit ten miles an hour on my bike
16 several times. I actually got in a car accident right
17 by the pit. My car was totaled. I did not fall into
18 the pit, but it was close. That is a hideous, hideous
19 hole in the ground. It used to be as tall as it is
20 deep. That is something that we could have climbed.
21 That is something that we could have hiked, but we
22 can't because it's full of toxic, what we call slag.

23 Now, I have couple of minutes left so I
24 wanted to point out that this is sacred land. Oak
25 Creek is -- Oak Flat, that is sacred land.

1 So consider this, if you're not able to
2 conceptualize, to empathize with another culture,
3 consider if the St. Patrick Cathedral or any of the
4 other holy places, we'll just stay general, if somebody
5 was just like, okay, well, you know, these people,
6 they've been going here for a while, we'll save St.
7 Patrick Cathedral because it's in the U.S. and it's New
8 York.

9 If somebody were to say, there's stuff
10 under there that we're going to pay you for or we have
11 to demolish your place of worship and we're going to
12 destroy the surrounding neighborhoods. But -- oh, wait
13 there's not a but, because it's still, you know,
14 affecting the health and the environment and the
15 surroundings.

16 So I really urge you to consider instead
17 of putting your money towards something that is not
18 going to be a long-term thing, put it towards something
19 that's going to be helping the environment because
20 that's where we need it.

21 DUKE ROMERO: Duke Romero,
22 D-u-k-e R-o-m-e-r-o.

23 This is my third meeting and I'm going to
24 say the same thing I said at all three is I oppose this
25 mine for my children. My daughter, we're getting ready

1 for her coming of age ceremony. We started the
2 preparations. She wants it at Oak Flat. We're
3 starting preparations for that up at Oak Flat. And my
4 nieces have had their dances there.

5 My son, both of them now, play, grew up in
6 that area. All these children, there's a lot of
7 children in here today, a lot of adults, young adults
8 that have their whole life ahead of them and you're
9 going cut that short by bringing all this toxic
10 element, these minerals exposed arsenic, mercury, heavy
11 metals.

12 And, you know, we already have these
13 haboobs and now you're going to introduce, what, 400
14 billion cubic tons of waste to that. You know, all of
15 these people, every single one of you breathe oxygen.
16 You know what, I live here the in Valley now. And I
17 wake up every morning to my kids coughing and hacking
18 because of the pollution here and now.

19 You know, Rio Tinto's headquarters is in
20 Salt Lake City. The largest open pit mine right now is
21 under their care, their mine in Salt Lake City. And
22 look at the air quality of Salt Lake City. They tried
23 to sue them, you know, and they don't even have the
24 climate that we have. It's going to dry up all that
25 toxic even more and bring it to all of these folks

1 here, you know. And I'm not even talking about the
2 spirituality of it, just the poison you're going to
3 allow. You're part of that. You are part of that.

4 All of these children, the future of all
5 of these young people out here. You know, the miners
6 come in here, when the mine closes up, you'll leave and
7 follow the work. You won't live in this toxic mess
8 that is left behind. You know, all you suits that are
9 paid, you, all you suits, you'll pick up, you'll leave.
10 You're going to leave this mess to all these children,
11 all these young adults that have their whole life ahead
12 of them. You're all part of that. Every single one of
13 you is part of that.

14 You know, I have my little one here. Why
15 do I have to keep bringing him? He's 16 months old.
16 His umbilical cord is buried up there and I have to
17 keep coming here. You guys know this wrong, every
18 single one of you know this wrong. We're all going to
19 remember. Even you over here with your three minutes.
20 This is a lifetime.

21 BRIAN BALLARD: My name's Brian Ballard,
22 B-r-i-a-n B-a-l-l-a-r-d.

23 Thank you for allowing me to speak. Thank
24 you everyone for staying so late tonight for such an
25 important topic.

1 I just want to preface what I want to say
2 by describing what I do for work. I am an architect.
3 I'm a licensed architect so I know the value of
4 resources. I know how much copper goes into my
5 buildings. I design K-12 schools in the Phoenix area.
6 So I enjoy what I do for future generations.

7 But I know that sustainability is critical
8 to everything that we do. And as an architect in my
9 firm, every project that we do, sustainability is
10 absolutely key. So there's a better way to go about
11 this than what's being proposed.

12 So my story was I was brought to Oak Flat
13 to learn how to rock climb. You know, we went by the
14 cities of Superior and we saw the existing mines. We
15 saw the mine near by. And then we walked through this
16 incredibly beautiful riparian area. And the life there
17 was just so special. And the quality of the rock is
18 just out of this world. It's literally out of this
19 world. It's such a unique place. And I loved how to
20 learn -- how to rock climb there. I still climb there
21 to this very day.

22 This is Phoenix's local craft, you know.
23 For those who do not climb, you just can't climb
24 anywhere. I mean, there are so many diverse areas
25 within the Oak Flat/Queen Creek area, as we've

1 described it. There's an incredible diverse range of
2 climbing here. So that is really, really worthwhile as
3 a resource, you know, talking about resources such as
4 metals.

5 And the point I want to make about that is
6 there's a group called the Access Fund, who stands up
7 for climbing in America and they have called out the
8 fact that this will be the single biggest loss of
9 climbing resources at any one time in the history of
10 our country, so, you know, think about that for a
11 moment.

12 And I want to reinforce the point that was
13 made earlier about the economy. The outdoor industry
14 is incredibly powerful and it's growing. It's not just
15 climbing, it's hiking. It's camping. It's
16 backpacking. It's mountain biking. Those jobs are
17 local, you know. That is more worthwhile than these
18 foreign investors coming in and proclaiming that this
19 is going to help our economy long term.

20 You know, we spend a lot of money on gear,
21 let me tell you that. So climbers, you know, yeah
22 we'll go somewhere else, if we don't have climbing
23 here, sure. We're going to take our business to
24 another city, to another state, to another country. We
25 don't want that to happen, okay. Arizona is an

1 incredibly beautiful state. Our tourism is super
2 important to what we do in our state.

3 So, you know, that as a resource needs to
4 be defined, okay, and measured up against all of the
5 other resources.

6 In closing, I just want to say that -- the
7 other point I wanted to make was about climate change.
8 Just recently there were incredible climate strikes
9 that happened all across this world. The youth raised
10 their voice, okay. The future generations raised their
11 voice, okay. And the impact, the carbon impact and the
12 emissions from this is not something that was
13 considered enough in the Draft Environmental Impact
14 Statement. So to be constructive, we need a balance
15 here. We need a time out to say how can we do this
16 properly, smart, all right. Tell your friends, okay.
17 I know a lot of people that do not know about this. Do
18 not give up yet.

19 Thank you very much.

20 SYLVIA BARRETT: Sylvia Barrett,
21 S-y-l-v-i-a B-a-r-r-e-t-t.

22 Remember this, subsidence can continue to
23 occur up to 20 years or more after mining ceases.

24 Volume 1, page 132 on subsidence, quote, "There are
25 several areas of uncertainty and some areas of sparse

1 or low confidence data. Actual surface subsidence
2 could vary from the model results." To paraphrase on
3 the subsidence issue of Volume 1, pages 149 to 150, "If
4 monitor indicates slight damaging of new cracks or
5 existing cracks, Resolution would continue to monitor
6 and update subsidence modeling. If monitoring
7 indicates moderate to severe damage, Resolution would
8 increase monitoring frequency, would inform the Forest
9 Service, update subsidence model and change draw strategy
10 and mine plans. If monitoring shows new cracks or
11 extension of existing cracks in the area or on U.S. 60,
12 Resolution would continue monitoring and update the
13 subsidence model. Environmental protection methods
14 would reduce impacts to U.S. 60, mine roads, buildings
15 in Oak Flat depending on the level of effect observed.
16 If monitoring shows extensive formation of new cracks
17 or extension of existing cracks in the area or on
18 U.S. 60 that are moderate to severe, Resolution would
19 increase monitoring, inform relevant public
20 authorities, update subsidence model and increased road
21 maintenance programs and repairs. To prevent exposure
22 of the public to these hazards, Resolution will use
23 fencing, berms, et cetera, to limit access roads and
24 locations near areas of heavy recreational use."

25 Volume 1, page 153, "Shows the fracture

1 limit will be 340 meters from the Apache Leap area.
2 340 meters is 3.7 football fields." That's how close
3 it is. "Once again, ground movement can continue up to
4 20 years after mining stops."

5 I remember that several years ago ADOT had
6 plans to reroute U.S. 60 through Montana Mountain. I
7 can no longer find that information on their site. Is
8 it still a possibility? Many times when it rains or
9 snows, rocks fall off the mountain and onto U.S. 60.
10 With all the ground movement and subsidence just feet
11 from U.S. 60, are you going to tell me that you are not
12 going to close U.S. 60's current location rerouting it
13 around Superior, thereby, killing the town's future
14 prosperity.

15 This project is not ready to move forward.
16 It needs to go back to Congress and all of our
17 questions need to be answered before it becomes final.

18 Does Arizona want farming and bringing
19 more people into this state or do we want mining? The
20 scarcity of water will not allow all of these things.

21 DARLENE LESLIE: Darlene Leslie,
22 D-a-r-l-e-n-e L-e-s-l-i-e.

23 First, three minutes is not enough for the
24 time for the public to be heard. I'm here in
25 opposition of the mine. My main concern is water. I

1 have been asking where the water resource is coming
2 from and I haven't gotten a competent answer to
3 reassure me. Arizona is a state that needs water, not
4 a want but a need. My concern is for the people,
5 ranchers, farmers and the resources for the economy for
6 Arizona. Yes, copper, but also cattle and citrus.

7 From what I understand the production of
8 citrus is on the low. The water is in need for the
9 livestock. With tailings not being 100 percent secure
10 concerns me. I have heard Resolution will pay for
11 cleaning water, but only to a certain boundary. That
12 is unethical for residents living downstream. Tailings
13 contain chemicals that its purpose is to breakdown the
14 copper that can cause cancer.

15 As a Hopi, my tribe has already
16 experienced arsenic. And to this day, it is not being
17 cleaned. As an Apache, I'm concerned for the storage
18 of tailings close to our borders.

19 To mine and to -- to mine and to drill for
20 wells you need water. And from what I understand, this
21 is going to be one of the largest in the world and it
22 will need tons of water. Oak Flat has more resources
23 for the public than -- from the public than the copper
24 mine will provide. It's copper is not taxed and the
25 cost is more to when we buy after selling it to other

1 countries.

2 As far as I know, these are ideas, not a
3 solid plan. Arizona is not ready to support a copper
4 mine. We have rights to land, water and air.

5 The last thing, this is mental abuse to me
6 and unethical to me personally. You are stealing my
7 identity, as you did, with the land through a night
8 rider. My children and their future children have a
9 right to participate in their ceremonial religion and
10 the natural harvesting on what was once public land.
11 Let's get a repeal and get our land back. We say no.

12 I just want to say that we have a
13 precedence. This is not just Oak Flat. We are setting
14 a precedence worldwide. There's a lot of indigenous
15 people that are fighting because it was our steward --
16 we are stewards to the land. All the people that are
17 not Native Americans, you have those same rights and
18 I'm so thankful that you are here, because that is your
19 birth right. That is everybody birth's right.

20 So right here and now, I ask that you
21 please stop because it needs to stop. You see all the
22 climatrics (phonetic), all the abuse you're doing to
23 the humans, to the animals, to the plants it's wrong.
24 One of the things that my grandpa told me is to make
25 sure you stand up for what is right. And I'm saying

1 this wrong. So what you guys need to do is stop.

2 And I hope that legislators and the
3 leaders make sure that they make the right choices and
4 represent the people. We are the people. This is our
5 democracy and they cannot say otherwise. So that's
6 just what I wanted to say.

7 MIGUEL GARCIA: Hello. My name is Miguel
8 Garcia, M-i-g-u-e-l G-a-r-c-i-a. I'm member of the
9 United Steelworkers Local 3937. Originally our
10 International Union President, Tom Conway, sent a
11 letter to the U.S. Forest Service commenting on the
12 Draft Environment Impact Statement.

13 Our union is very impressed with the
14 amount of public participation in this process and the
15 changes that Resolution Copper has made as a result of
16 that input. That public participation makes this
17 process of Resolution mine more trustworthy. Our union
18 represents a significant number of miners in the United
19 States and Canada who extract mining materials,
20 including copper.

21 The union works hard to make sure that the
22 communities around its workplaces are safe places to
23 live. I can personally speak to the benefits of being
24 a member of the steelworkers and union's ability to
25 hold employers accountable for jobs and the safety of

1 the workers and the community and the environment.
2 We're a key -- a stakeholder in this region and want to
3 make sure that Resolution Copper keeps its
4 environmental, safety and economic commitments as
5 outlined in this draft.

6 The thousands of high quality jobs that
7 this mine could support will be very good for this
8 region. As the draft document says, this mine would
9 bring over a billion dollars of economic activity to
10 Arizona.

11 One of the important reasons that our
12 union believes this mine should move forward is that
13 our society has a clear need for more copper to produce
14 the low greenhouse gas admissions technologies to fight
15 climate change. I'm talking about the winter bines
16 (phonetic), batteries, electric cars and more of the
17 efficient electric grids.

18 But we need to be sure that mining the
19 copper we need to fight climate change happens in a way
20 that creates good paying jobs, safe jobs where workers
21 have union protections. An environmental system like
22 this is necessary for a mine like this to move forward.
23 We believe Resolution Copper will continue a
24 stakeholder engagement it began through this process.
25 And we think this creates a strong basis for the

1 project to move forward.

2 I refer you to the letter of our
3 International President Thomas Conway sent to the
4 Forest Service. For more detail, I'll leave a copy of
5 it in the front, if you guys like, and also a press
6 release.

7 Thank you.

8 LUCINDA HINOJOS: So -- oh, my name is
9 Lucinda -- oh, actually -- yeah, my name is Lucinda
10 Hinojos. I'm actually a painter, a muralist and an
11 activist and I use my art for activism. I'm Chikawa,
12 Pima and Yachi descent from my mother's side and I'm
13 Chicana.

14 At first I wasn't going to speak. But
15 after hearing and coming here, I made it -- an
16 initiative to come and show my support. Because about
17 two years ago I was invited out to Apache Stronghold's
18 gathering. I was able to attend some -- be there on
19 San Carlos and Oak Flat and attend a ceremony and meet,
20 you know, the family. And they opened and invited the
21 people that were there, they took care of us. They
22 greeted us. They showed us their ceremonies. They
23 spoke to us and educated us on the topic.

24 I am born and raised from Phoenix,
25 Arizona. My family is from Phoenix, Arizona. And my

1 ancestors are from this land that we're on. I think
2 what you're forgetting is that the land that you're on,
3 the land that you're trying to take is sacred land. So
4 not only are you going to be fighting against the
5 people and the community, you're going to be going
6 against our spirits, our ancestors, because they will
7 stand with us and they will fight with us.

8 And it is a proven fact that miracles
9 happen on that sacred land. And I just wanted to let
10 people know that that's what we're forgetting that the
11 community will figure it out. You're in a conscious
12 awaking environment now. You think that -- right now
13 not many people know about this topic in Phoenix,
14 Arizona. They don't know about this.

15 But as an artist and what I do, I've
16 brought -- I've raised awareness on so many topics, the
17 missing and murdered indigenous women, our DACA, our
18 Dreamers in South Phoenix. And guess whose card I have
19 in my hand? Congressman Greg Staton. He said if I
20 needed anything, because he supports everything that I
21 do and he sheds light on the missing and murdered
22 indigenous women using his platform because of my
23 words, because of our people, because of our community,
24 because we're tired of going through this over and
25 over. All you do is take and take and take because of

1 money, because of power, because of evil. But,
2 remember, what you put out into the universe comes back
3 three times fold. You have you to remember that.

4 And I don't care what your faith is, but
5 understand that there's people power and we will not
6 sit and we not let you go through us and you will not
7 walk over us. You will not build over communities.
8 You will learn how to work with the community. But it
9 seems like you don't want to listen. So guess what,
10 this will become international news, if you will want
11 to fight me. And that's it.

12 Thank you.

13 CARLOS GONZALES: My name is Carlos
14 Gonzales, C-a-r-l-o-s G-o-n-z-a-l-e-s.

15 I was born and raised in Superior. I went
16 to school there. And I worked in the mine for several
17 years. There's some concerns that I have about it.

18 First of all, it's never been explained to
19 me adequately on why we can't backfill some of the
20 mining areas that would occur. So having worked in the
21 mine, I know that we used to use the waste to backfill
22 some of those mining areas. Another concern that I
23 have is that in all the time that I worked there, at
24 that time it was Magma Copper Company.

25 Magma Copper Company did not contribute

1 too much to the town of Superior. And many of us grew
2 up almost disadvantaged because a lot of us grew up in
3 inadequate housing. And Magma never helped out. We
4 didn't have a very good sewer system. We didn't have
5 very good streets. Our schools were just getting by.
6 We did get a lot of the coursework, classroom work that
7 we should have gotten as compared to some of the other
8 more sophisticated schools.

9 So I haven't heard or seen anything that
10 Resolution Copper has come out with to say, well, we're
11 going to improve your streets. We're going to help
12 those needy people who need housing. We're going to
13 help with the rebuilding of the downtown area. We're
14 going to help out with sewage that might be needed.
15 We're going to help out with the garbage disposition.
16 I haven't heard anything like that. So those are some
17 of the concerns that I have.

18 Then, lastly, I say, you know, this has
19 been going on for several years. Resolution Copper
20 trying to get this mine into effect. But I've seen
21 very little activity other than public hearings coming
22 out of all of you that have concerns about it. And
23 what I want to tell you is that is in this country
24 there are real change that has occurred, has been
25 because people were willing to go out in the streets

1 and fight for what they wanted, the Civil Rights
2 movement, Cesar Chavez, the Civil War, doing away with
3 slavery, that's how things got done by people going out
4 in the streets and marching, you know, and risking --
5 risking their lives so that they could have change
6 occurring.

7 I'm not saying that you should go out
8 there and get yourself killed, but for heaven's sakes I
9 haven't seen any rallying or any demonstrating going on
10 in the streets, you know. And that's what I think.
11 I've got news for you, this is going to happen. This
12 mine is going to happen and the only chance you have of
13 it not happening is to go out there in the streets and
14 fight for what you believe in.

15 Thank you.

16 MANUEL SALDANA: Hello, everybody. My
17 name is Manuel Saldana, M-a-n-u-e-l S-a-l-d-a-n-a.

18 And I want to thank everybody who is
19 opposing the mine, everything that you all said. It
20 touched touch my heart and you've said everything that
21 needed to be said.

22 I did want to point out a few things, when
23 I was reading the poster boards, they all seem kind of
24 biased towards the mine. The only board I agree with
25 is this one, the one that says "Ground Rules." And

1 it's be courteous and treat Mother Earth with respect.
2 Allow Mother Earth the opportunity to be heard. And
3 honor the differing opinion of not allowing her to be
4 raped anymore because you don't have her consent to be
5 doing this to her and to observe the time which has
6 been thousands of years of people living on this land.
7 Millions of years of that land being interrupted and
8 the generations that are coming.

9 I was also a two-time Afghan veteran. And
10 when I saw what was happening at Standing Rock and
11 realizing everything that happened -- that was
12 happening to the people there, to the land, to the --
13 not only did I, but a bunch of other veterans got
14 together and we went because we saw what was happening
15 to the people there. A young woman's arm was blown up
16 because of these type of projects.

17 The elder here earlier said she would go
18 again there and stand so that no one would do this.
19 I'm not going to let her or my little -- my younger
20 sisters and all my other relatives do that -- to do
21 that by themselves. So when we went up there we asked
22 forgiveness to the (unintelligible) genocide that the
23 U.S. military had done. And I hope that you all ask
24 for forgiveness and I see goodness in you. And I hope
25 that you stop this project before that comes to

1 happening.

2 One of the 20 veterans went from Arizona
3 to South Dakota and one of them lives in Surprise. And
4 I'm sure that if we want -- when he gives the call that
5 we're going to go there and we're going to make sure
6 that this mine doesn't happen. And I thank everybody
7 that was here and keep on fighting.

8 (Hearing comments concluded at 8:34 p.m.)

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25