

In The Matter Of:

*Resolution Copper Project and Land Exchange Draft EIS
Public Hearing*

*Public Comments
September 19, 2019*



**G R I F F I N G R O U P
I N T E R N A T I O N A L**

2398 East Camelback Road, Suite 260
Phoenix, Arizona 85016

Original File SWCA-WAT-091919 SWCA091919 USFS.txt

Min-U-Script® with Word Index

RESOLUTION COPPER PROJECT AND)
LAND EXCHANGE DRAFT EIS)
PUBLIC HEARING)
_____)

High Desert Middle School
4000 High Desert Drive
Globe, Arizona

PUBLIC COMMENTS

September 19, 2019
6:02 p.m.

REPORTED BY:
TERESA A. WATSON, RMR
Certified Reporter
Certificate No. 50876

PREPARED FOR:
U.S. Forest Service

(Certified Copy)

PUBLIC COMMENTS

	SPEAKER:	PAGE:
1		
2		
3	Cranston Hoffman - Opening Prayer.....	4
4	Nancy Thias.....	5
5	Vernelda Grant.....	6
6	Anna Jeffrey.....	8
7	Brytnee Miller.....	10
8	Vanessa Nosie.....	11
9	Nizhoni Pike.....	13
10	Roger Featherstone.....	14
11	Kimberly Oddonetto.....	17
12	Geraldine Kitcheyan.....	17
13	Roy Chavez.....	19
14	Don Zobel.....	21
15	Cindy Brady.....	23
16	Morgun Frejo.....	25
17	Henry Munoz, Senior.....	26
18	Leslie Glass.....	28
19	Wendsler Nosie, Senior.....	29
20	Naelyn Pike.....	32
21	Angel Hooke.....	33
22	Baase Pike.....	35
23	Tom Wright.....	36
24	Cranston Hoffman.....	37
25	Anthony Logan.....	39

PUBLIC COMMENTS

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SPEAKER:	PAGE:
Mitchell Michaels.....	39
Carrie Curley.....	41
Margie Curley.....	43
Sandra Rambler.....	44
Michael Macias.....	47
Joseph Monroi.....	49
Elisabeth Henning.....	50
Dennis Wiley.....	52
Selina Curley.....	54
Sandra Rambler.....	55
Roy Chavez.....	57
Wendsler Nosie, Senior.....	59
Speaker.....	62
Speaker.....	63
Henry Munoz, Senior.....	64

1 MS. GRAMS: We're going to start. Ms. Sandra
2 Rambler is going to provide a welcome to you.

3 SANDRA RAMBLER: Hello. I'd like to introduce
4 one of our (unintelligible) medicine men, spiritual men from San
5 Carlos. His name is Cranston Hoffman. He's also
6 (unintelligible). And if everyone could please stand, and he
7 can come and say a prayer in Apache.

8 CRANSTON HOFFMAN: In Apache culture,
9 traditionally we pray with the pollen. In Christian, people
10 pray with the oil, olive oil. Sort of represents the same
11 thing. So this prayer is presented, it's is kind of like a more
12 section to this prayer, and praise for everybody in the world,
13 and so at this time just pray within yourself and just meditate
14 within yourself pray and on behalf of everybody here and on the
15 order. In the name of the Father, the Son and the Holy Spirit,
16 amen.

17 (Speaking Native language.)

18 We come before you, oh precious Lord (speaking
19 Native language). All things that we're going to talk about
20 tonight, things that, you know, is into the future, is in your
21 hands, but as man thinks, you know, but we pray for the goodness
22 and for the good. (Speaking Native language), chairman, vice
23 chairman (Speaking Native language). United States nation
24 (speaking Native language), military (speaking Native language).

25 We ask all these things in your name, precious

1 Jesus. You are the one that gives us life. Gives us
2 everything, our life, our health, everything that we own, from
3 the bottom of our feet, through the head, everything. Our
4 health, especially. We give you thanks for everything in this
5 world, everything that we do, we travel, where we go, what we
6 do, where we sleep, what we think about, our job, everything.
7 You, it belongs to you, everything, and we can go, come up to
8 you and ask you to bless all of these things.

9 And all these things and all this stuff that
10 started to happen in this world has been predicted before. In
11 the Apache, history of the Apache, prayers and stuff, visions
12 that were shown by my elders, it is coming to pass now, and we
13 kind of understand that when they try to change it and ask the
14 precious Lord over all things, and he's the one that, you know,
15 can change things in our life for us.

16 This we pray in the almighty name, the Father
17 (unintelligible), amen. In the name of the Father and the Son
18 and Spirit, amen. Thank you.

19 (Opening presentation and video.)

20 NANCY THIAS: Hi. I'm Nancy Thias. It's
21 N-a-n-c-y T-h-i-a-s. I live in Chandler, but I do come up here
22 for recreation, and I'm currently at the campground that's going
23 to be affected. I have sisters that were involved in the
24 Phoenix Boulderling Contest for a number of years.

25 (unintelligible) a lot of interest. Of course, that's subsided,

1 but there's still a huge climbing community that comes up here
2 as well. So we'll be affected.

3 Mainly, though, I am concerned about the
4 tailings. I understand that the tailings were going to be
5 anywhere from two and a half to 51 minutes before it would hit
6 population. That is quite a concern. It's my understanding
7 that this project should last approximately 50 years, and these
8 tailings can last millennia. So my concern is who's going to
9 watch those? Who's going to make sure that they don't leak or
10 seep? And in addition, it's my understanding that they will
11 leach within 90 days. My question is how would that be
12 addressed?

13 Thank you.

14 MS. GRAMS: Number 5.

15 And I would ask that -- we have the court
16 reporter behind you, so just make sure that you're at the
17 microphone and enunciating so that she gets all of your comment.

18 VERNELDA GRANT: Good evening. My name is
19 Vernelda Grant, V-e-r-n-e-l-d-a, last name Grant, G-r-a-n-t.
20 And I'm supposed to give what else? I forgot.

21 MS. GRAMS: That's it.

22 VERNELDA GRANT: Okay. My clan is (speaking
23 Native language) and born into (speaking Native language) on my
24 father's side, based on out of Payson. Although my clan is not
25 in the area of Oak Flat, it's a very important place where my

1 family has stopped to say prayers, to collect water, to collect
2 acorn for many, many years. Something that we didn't really
3 publicize. Something that we didn't look for in articles or
4 really didn't get a chance to share with the world. We just
5 shared with ourselves family time.

6 I'm wanting to share two points, major points
7 that the Oak Flats is a cultural landscape that will be
8 negatively affected. It's a landscape. It's not just a metes
9 and bounds measured property. It's not a little point on a map
10 to us. It's unique because it's located between the Phoenix
11 basin and the higher Sonoran desert scrub region. Twenty-one
12 food and medicinal plants live there. Water live -- used to
13 flow there around moss, as I remember collecting water coming
14 down from the rocks.

15 And, you know, that's -- my second point is our
16 connection to the land will be directly affected. When I say
17 "our," my family being very traditional was taught that we
18 respect the land. Anywhere we go, we give thanks. We collect
19 water, give thanks and say prayers, not just for ourselves, but
20 for everybody in this world, for Mother Earth. And the
21 connection we have is a spiritual connection. It can't be
22 something that we can measure in a half-hour class. It's
23 something that we can't measure within this building. My faith
24 and who I believe in and the faith that I have, raised by my
25 family, and the thing that is discussed in my culture and songs

1 in our language, in our prayers, it just can't be measured. And
2 it's -- it can't -- it's not measured in this Draft EIS. No
3 words can put together how our connection will be lost when this
4 place is desecrated.

5 Culturally, there's -- we're going to have --
6 continue to have social ills. You know, our county is still
7 going to be negatively affected, because places like these are
8 holy, are going to be destroyed and disconnected. It's going to
9 be disconnecting us ourselves. And I just come here with an
10 open heart, with an open mind, that all of us in here matter.
11 This place matters, and all of you guys matter, and I stand here
12 just to let you know that we need to -- there's nowhere else for
13 us to go.

14 And so I thank you for your time.

15 MS. GRAMS: 21.

16 ANNA JEFFREY: My name is Anna Jeffrey, A-n-n-a,
17 J-e-f-f-r-e-y, born and raised in Superior, still live there.
18 Oak Flat is very, very precious to me.

19 You know, I don't see or hear, but I asked my
20 mayor -- I've been to almost all of these, and I asked her, you
21 know, when Superior's destroyed and there's a lot of dust and
22 there's a lot of vibration and -- well, might as well take the
23 scenic highway sign down, right? When all that occurs and
24 there's possible ground subsidence coming right down across
25 Creek Canyon, which is basically right by my backyard, who's

1 responsible? That's what I want to know, when all this
2 destruction takes place and changes lives for the worst.

3 Who's responsible? Is it the Superior council,
4 because they didn't stand up for this -- against this
5 destruction? Is it the Forest Department, because they didn't
6 stand up against protecting against Rio Tinto? Or is it Rio
7 Tinto's fault, or is it the government's fault? I want to know
8 who is going to be responsible for all of these life changes and
9 health issues and displacements and heartache and depression and
10 everything that would come with it.

11 You know, if you think about it -- well, what she
12 said, actually, she says, "Well, it doesn't really matter,
13 because it wouldn't happen for about 20 years." You know,
14 that -- that just -- that really bothered me that she would say
15 something like that. So roll the clock 20 years forward and,
16 you know, was it all worth it? Think about it, you know. What
17 side of history do you want to be on? The side that allowed it
18 to happen or the side that fought against it?

19 I also would like to request that this meeting
20 also be held in San Carlos, because, you know, when I first
21 heard about Oak Flat, I knew from the get-go the first people I
22 was going to reach out to were the Apaches, because they hold
23 that place more sacred than anyone, and so I think it should
24 happen.

25 And if I can pass my -- pass forward the rest of

1 my minutes, I would like to do that if that's allowed.

2 Thank you.

3 MS. GRAMS: Number 12.

4 BRYTNEE MILLER: Hello. My name is Brytnee
5 Miller, and that's B-r-y-t-n-e-e M-i-l-l-e-r.

6 So I work for the Center for Biological Diversity
7 as an Arizona state campaigner. So I know firsthand, I've seen
8 firsthand how destructive to the environment, you know, mines
9 are, and especially in Oak Flat. That is a world-renowned rock
10 climbing area. It's part of America's public land heritage.
11 This is such an important place.

12 But before any of my work title, I'm an
13 indigenous woman of Diné, and because of that, I want to stand
14 with and acknowledge and honor this land. It is sacred land to
15 the Apaches. And, you know, my mom was adopted, so I didn't get
16 to grow up with my holy places, and I probably will never get to
17 know them like a lot of other people do, and it -- reading the
18 Draft Environmental Impact Statement, I realize just how we can
19 say, you know, this is -- there's cultural artifacts as this,
20 but it doesn't come close to really acknowledging or pushing
21 forward how special these lands are and how their people -- you
22 know, there's young people who have their coming of age
23 ceremonies here, and that needs to be protected.

24 This land needs to be protected, and if not here,
25 for my generation, for the next generations, and I'm sure you're

1 going to hear from some of the younger folks today who this land
2 is their land, their sacred land, Oak Flat. So I just wanted to
3 say I oppose this project and (speaking Native language).

4 Thank you.

5 MS. GRAMS: Number 7.

6 VANESSA NOSIE: Hello. My name is Vanessa Nosie,
7 V-a-n-e-s-s-a N-o-s-i-e.

8 Well, first, you know, listening over and over
9 and sitting at these meetings and hearing the destruction, I
10 turned and I even told Neil Bosworth that this is premeditated
11 murder on a sacred site, not only for my cultural -- the
12 significance of my culture. The direct connection that we have
13 to the land, to our God, to the creator, but for all these
14 people from our neighboring towns, the water that's going to
15 continue to give them life so that they can live, the plants,
16 the animals. This is a complete destruction and murder on a
17 land and environment and a continued genocide on my culture and
18 my religion.

19 I come from Oak Flat Chi'Chil'Ba'Goteel. I grew
20 up there. I picked my acorns. I picked medicine with my
21 grandmother. I raised my children there. I have three girls.
22 One who had her coming of age ceremony. My youngest daughter
23 had began her coming of age ceremony. When Oak Flat is
24 destroyed, you are cutting my children's life in half. Remember
25 that. Because in our way and our belief, this paints their

1 (unintelligible) for the rest of their life, as human beings,
2 not just as Apache people, but human beings who are placed on
3 this earth.

4 You are killing my children and those yet to be
5 born. Someday my children are going to have children. I'm
6 going to be a grandmother, and I'm going to be a
7 great-grandmother, and my religion is going to die because Tonto
8 National U.S. Forest Service and Resolution Copper is going to
9 kill Oak Flat. Now, tell me how do I explain that to those yet
10 to be born? How do I pass on oral history that was given to me
11 from generation to generation from my grandmother, my
12 grandfather, from my father and my ancestors before them?

13 You can go to church. You can sit there and
14 praise God. My church is sitting at Oak Flat. My church is at
15 Chi'Chil'Ba'Goteel. That is my church. That is my way of life,
16 and how can you disregard it? How can you say it does not
17 exist? Just because you don't understand? Someone needs to
18 make a moral decision. If you were in my place and having to
19 tell my children that their way of life might not no longer
20 exist, how are you going to handle it?

21 So I ask you, open your mind. Open your heart,
22 because we as indigenous people are not only protecting Oak Flat
23 and our culture and our religion and our people, but we're
24 protecting each and every one of you, all the different towns.
25 The metropolitan area is going to be a huge disaster.

1 (Speaking Native language.)

2 MS. GRAMS: Okay. The next five numbers are 11,
3 2, 1, 10 and then 24.

4 NIZHONI PIKE: (Speaking Native language.) My
5 name is Nizhoni Pike, N-i-z-h-o-n-i P-i-k-e.

6 I'm my mother's daughter who had it at Oak Flat.
7 I grew up going to Oak Flat with my great-grandmother, going to
8 go pick acorn, and the Apache places, the berries
9 (unintelligible), everything, and that's going to be erased from
10 me. My kids, I can't even tell my kids where I had my Sunrise
11 dance. I cannot even take them and show them where I became a
12 woman, not even give them the option to have their ceremony
13 there.

14 I write stories and essays in my college about
15 Oak Flat, because that's how much it means to me. My -- the
16 significance to me, means so much. It goes so -- my heart is
17 broken knowing that you guys are letting this happen, that you
18 guys are saying yes to cutting my religion, my culture, to -- in
19 half, because after me, my generation are the only ones that are
20 learning about Oak Flat, that are practicing the religions.

21 I'm one of the first few who started having
22 Sunrise dances off of reservations and going back to our sacred
23 lands. I went back to my sacred land, Oak Flat. My sister went
24 to Mountain Graham, and other girls in our family and in our
25 reservation and our -- in our tribe have went to have their

1 dances in other places. This -- even my two little cousins that
2 look up to me had their dances at Oak Flat. And how can I
3 explain to my kids? Look what happened.

4 You know, it's just -- it's hard. I cannot even
5 begin to explain what I've been going through ever since you
6 guys let it -- when they -- when Resolution put it into the
7 bill, because that was two years after my dance. I prayed into
8 the spring and washed off my (unintelligible) off into the
9 spring, and then, like, one year later after that, it was gone.
10 It was empty. And I cried. I cried so hard, because that is
11 where I went to wash off my (unintelligible), and to know that
12 water is being taken broke my heart.

13 I just -- after this, it's like our future Apache
14 kids aren't going to start -- not knowing who their -- where
15 they came from, where our culture came from, where their
16 ancestors came from. I just hope you take that about my kids.
17 Other kids are not going to be able to know their religion, not
18 going to know their culture. I think it's important, because
19 I -- this is my culture and my way of life is from the Creator,
20 and you're just taking that from me and my family and my people.

21 MS. GRAMS: Number 2.

22 ROGER FEATHERSTONE: Hello. My name is Roger
23 Featherstone, R-o-g-e-r F-e-a-t-h-e-r-s-t-o-n-e. I am director
24 of the Arizona Mining Reform Coalition. We will be submitting
25 detailed comments about why this project is wrong, but -- and we

1 ask that the DEIS be withdrawn, rewritten, reissued with a new
2 comment period. There are many problems with this -- with this
3 proposal, the DEIS. There's an inadequate look at the
4 transportation issues, didn't look at all the alternatives.
5 Many of the alternatives that are listed, you have problems with
6 the analysis. And in general, this project is putting the cart
7 ahead of the horse.

8 Rio Tinto has put other projects ahead of the
9 pipeline over this project at Oak Flat. And if that's the case,
10 why are you moving with such speed toward a decision on this?

11 Rio Tinto is currently building a mine in
12 Mongolia, a very similar mine called Oyu Tolgoi, that has a
13 block cave facility that will be exactly like what they're
14 planning here, only much more shallow, and they're also looking
15 at a -- they've also built a tailings facility that's designed
16 the same. The tailings facility started leaking after three
17 years, and Rio Tinto is having a heck of a lot of problems
18 building the infrastructure for that block cave mine. Right now
19 they're more than a year behind schedule and \$2 billion over
20 budget. So again, if they can't even demonstrate in a -- in
21 another country that they can build this proposal, why is this
22 being moving forward here? And why isn't that laid out in the
23 DEIS?

24 The other reason the court's ahead of the horse
25 is -- or the cart is ahead of the horse, excuse me, is recently

1 in south of Tucson, there was a lawsuit over a mine called
2 Rosemont that a district court judge found in favor of the
3 plaintiffs, the tribes and the environmental groups, and said
4 that the Forest Service was improperly allowing the use of
5 mining claims. The short of it is it's a very similar situation
6 to here at Oak Flat, and right now, the decision to allow that
7 mine to be built has been put on -- has been remanded, and it's
8 back to the drawing board. So again, this DEIS should be pulled
9 until those questions are addressed.

10 The economics of this doesn't pencil out. It
11 would be of benefit only to Rio Tinto, and not the state of
12 Arizona. The jobs are highly inflated. Rio Tinto brags about
13 the automation, but yet they're talking 3,500 jobs.

14 Basically, in this situation, an old friend of
15 mine, former Congressman Jim Johnson, who's no longer with us,
16 said in regards to these types of things, used to tell me all
17 the time, "Roger, when they feel the heat, they start to see the
18 light." Hopefully on November 20 -- November 7th, unless we can
19 get that extended, the Forest Service will feel so much heat
20 that they'll realize what we've been telling them for 15 years,
21 that this project is an experiment. It will fail, and the only
22 thing to do is to stop it before it destroys Oak Flat and the
23 surrounding thousands of acres of public land.

24 Thank you.

25 MS. GRAMS: Number 1.

1 KIMBERLY ODDONETTO: My name is Kimberly
2 Oddonetto, K-i-m-b-e-r-l-y.

3 My company is a contractor for Resolution Copper.
4 We are thrilled to be a partner with a company that so heavily
5 invests in local communities surrounding the Copper Triangle.
6 Their commitment to employing from within the local communities
7 has allowed us to employ and supply over 200 employees over the
8 course of the past five years to their project. Approximately
9 90 percent of the employees come from within the Copper Triangle
10 area.

11 We have worked for all the local copper mines,
12 and Resolution Copper has by far went above and beyond in
13 regards to their commitment to their employees, to their
14 community, to their safety, cultures and their environmental
15 standards. I believe Resolution Copper is the only sustainable
16 copper mine for our future generations. We are thrilled and
17 excited to see their continued investment in the communities
18 that we call home.

19 Thank you.

20 MS. GRAMS: Number 10.

21 GERLADINE KITCHHEYAN: Geraldine Kitcheyan from
22 San Carlos, Arizona. G-e-r-a-l-d-i-n-e K-i-t-c-h-e-y-a-n.

23 If you would have told my husband what does the
24 last name mean -- he's gone now, my poor husband -- Kitcheyan,
25 he would say tall, dark and handsome. So I'm short, not too

1 tall, but I'm beautiful. I feel beautiful.

2 Thank you.

3 (Speaking Native language.) It's a grind acorn
4 [sic]. I am 74 years old, and I'm teaching my little
5 seven-year-old how to pick acorn, and I hunt with her in this
6 area, and there's lot of good acorn, and she enjoys it, and she
7 asks a lot of questions. So I plan to have a Sunrise dance for
8 her. I am already ordering an eagle from Alaska. And I want it
9 here, and I don't want it -- to think about not to do anything
10 with that. And I believe that if we -- if I'm not here -- God's
11 will, I'll be here, but I'd like to have a dance for her there,
12 and she will already know about the acorn.

13 This is what we do. We pick them up in acorn,
14 and then we grind it, and we put it into a soup. We make
15 dumpling, squash, corn, mixed together, and then we just -- we
16 do a lot of things with it. We eat, mostly -- the elderlies
17 love to pick acorn, and I am the one that love to pick acorn.
18 And I have spent four days doing this, and it's takes a lot of
19 hard work, but if it's -- if you guys do something about it and
20 destroy it, there will be nothing. There will be nothing.

21 So I just want you to know that it's very, very
22 important. We have a lot of food, and we do a lot of dancing
23 there, traditional dancing. The young man that opened prayer,
24 he's our medicine man, and we do a lot of praying with the holy
25 ground, we call it, and it's a very, very sacred -- one of the

1 sacred dances that is still there, and nobody's going to take
2 that away from us. And because we are strong, we're Apache,
3 we're going to stick together and we're going to fight you guys
4 all the way.

5 Thank you.

6 MS. GRAMS: 24.

7 ROY CHAVEZ: Here I am again. Roy Chavez, R-o-y
8 C-h-a-v-e-z, a lifelong third-generation resident of Superior,
9 Arizona. Served the town council, served as a four-term mayor,
10 and most recently, town manager of Superior.

11 Until I voiced my negativity against this
12 project, I also worked in several mines, including Magma BHP
13 before the closure '96. Worked in Kennecott, both in the open
14 pit and at the smelter, and I worked for Hecla Mine Company out
15 of Australia in production and development.

16 My comments today are in support of fighting
17 against this project. This is a vile project, ladies and
18 gentlemen. I've been involved with this personally since 1998
19 when I was mayor and they first came to me about reopening the
20 Magma mine through BHP. And I was advised at that time that
21 there would be a land exchange involved, and I asked at the
22 time, "A language exchange. That sounds great. Open the mine.
23 That sounds great." Hey, that's what we do. Unfortunately, the
24 land exchange involved the Oak Flat burial campground, sacred to
25 a lot of us. And the purpose was for what? We're going to do

1 block cave mining. As a miner and an underground miner, I said,
2 "The hell you are," as mayor.

3 That is a very unconventional method that's being
4 considered, and the technology's been developed for years, but
5 it's -- the most factual basis out of this entire project in the
6 EIS is the destruction, the environmental destruction impact,
7 the negative impact. Certainly, there's a few jobs. There's
8 always a few jobs in mining. But let me share something with
9 the people, and the mine admits this. This isn't your
10 grandfather's mine. Times have changed. Technology has taken
11 over. There will not be -- and by the way, the only taxable
12 income we get is from the employees that work for the company
13 and choose to live in our communities.

14 Look at every mining town in Arizona. They're
15 all dying on the vine. The industry has changed. They're
16 putting more money in their pocket. I just want to share with
17 you that this process as it's been going should have been
18 handled about ten years ago by our elected officials, but they
19 changed the law to allow this vile special interest legislation
20 to set a precedent before the NEPA was done, what we're doing
21 today. I guarantee you had this been done 10 years ago, the
22 elected officials that have been supporting this and spreading
23 the word that it's the best thing since sliced bread would have
24 never talked about it, and that's the predicament they're in
25 today. I agree with Roger. We hope that people will finally

1 realize with this study how vile this project is and how it
2 should be reconsidered, if not taken completely off the table.

3 This study has proven one thing. It reminds me
4 of a story of the sheriff that goes to the inmate in jail, and
5 he says, "Well, son, I got some good news and bad news. What's
6 the bad news? We got to hang you in the morning. Wow. What's
7 the good news? You get to pick the tree."

8 MS. GRAMS: Okay. The next five numbers are 14,
9 26, 8, 22 and 4.

10 DON ZOBEL: I'm Don Zobel, D-o-n Z-o-b-e-l.

11 At first blush you wonder how could something as
12 destructive as this be even considered, and kind of as I see it,
13 considered a done deal? You wonder how can that happen? What
14 system allows that? And then it occurred to me that these
15 foreign mining company executives have a fiduciary
16 responsibility to their shareholders to mine the copper the
17 cheapest that they can. And in fact, if they agreed to do
18 something that they weren't required to do, they could get sued
19 by the mining company or their shareholders.

20 And so, you know, I was talking to Jack McGregor
21 from Carlota. He was -- they're all foreign. These are
22 foreigners. They don't live here. They're gone, long gone, and
23 we live here. And I asked him, "Well, why don't you just fill
24 the pit in?" And he said, "Well, it costs us another 12 cents a
25 pound" -- in those days it was about 72 cents a pound -- "and

1 they don't require us to do it, so why should we?"

2 And so if you look at Rio Tinto -- go to Spain.
3 There's a place in Spain called Rio Tinto. That's where this --
4 these foreigners got their name, and it's just this bottomed-out
5 moon skin, and they walked off and left it, and I'm sure for the
6 same reason. They weren't required to do it.

7 So in this room there is only one person that
8 could stop this, and you have to buck up and tell them, "No.
9 We're not going to destroy Oak Flats." That mine, copper can be
10 mined without -- without destroying Oak Flats. Yeah, it might
11 cost more, or they have to get a little more clever, get a
12 better mining company, and it could be stopped. And if that
13 person -- Neil, if you buck up and tell them no, they will try
14 to get you fired.

15 I was working on Carlota. I was voicing my
16 opinion. The foreign mine company came in and tried to get me
17 fired from there, and they went up to the top of the food chain,
18 comes down to my little desk, maybe a manager or two up, and we
19 talked about it. And there are companies or there are places
20 that people have morals, and they told them, "No, we're not
21 going to fire him."

22 And so they will try to fire you if you do -- if
23 you stand up for America. You have a fiduciary responsibility
24 to America. You're the only thing standing between Oak Flats
25 being destroyed and not. There's nobody else in here can stop

1 that.

2 And every country has -- has people, turncoats
3 and traitors willing to work for these foreign companies. And
4 when we were in Europe, Europe had them during World War II, and
5 when you're in Europe -- we were on the -- looking over the
6 Normandy beaches and stuff. There's a plaque up there that said
7 the French contractors built Hitler's Atlantic Wall, and they
8 were -- they were the same kind of people that work for these
9 foreign companies. Why do they put that flag on that -- big
10 American flag on the tailings pile down there? They should put
11 whatever country they come from. They'll go back home and crawl
12 back under their rock.

13 MS. GRAMS: 26.

14 CINDY BRADY: My name is Cindy Brady, C-i-n-d-y
15 B-r-a-d-y.

16 My husband and my son and I, two and a half years
17 ago, searched and searched for a beautiful place that would be a
18 generational property for our family, for our kids, for our
19 grandkids and our great-grandkids. About six months after we
20 purchased the place, we hear that there's going to be a tailings
21 pile up the road.

22 I have mixed emotions. Part of the time I am so
23 tired that I don't feel I have a chance at fighting this, and
24 the rest of the time I'm so angry, and I just -- feeling
25 empowered to want to do something to stop this filthy thing from

1 happening on our land. It's about three miles, as a crow flies,
2 from our home where they want to put this scummy tailings pile.

3 Now, I tried to look at it with common sense
4 instead of my stupid emotions. I drove to Winkelman. I drove
5 to Kearny, and I drove to Ray mine. I know that's what our
6 place is going to look like.

7 Resolution does more than any other mine to try
8 to help clean things up. I appreciate everything they've done
9 for Kearny. Kearny still has brown water, scummy air, and that
10 hole in the ground at Ray mine, and the tailings pile just keeps
11 going up and up and up.

12 Figure out something else. Figure out a way to
13 mine that you're not ruining people's water and their air and
14 their homes and their lives. I can't even imagine what these
15 people who believe in Oak Flats and that's their -- that's their
16 home, and you people can do that to them? I don't -- I can't
17 fathom it.

18 I understand everybody has to make a living.
19 Those mines pay really well, and we have a couple of dear
20 friends that are with Resolution Copper. But you guys are
21 making a big, big moral mistake, and I just wish you'd
22 reconsider. I don't think what you're doing is right. It's not
23 right for you. It's not right for your children or your
24 grandchildren, and it's certainly not right for mine.

25 MS. GRAMS: Number 8.

1 MORGUN FREJO: (Speaking Native language.)

2 Hello. My name's Morgun Frejo, M-o-r-g-u-n F-r-e-j-o.

3 I disagree with this project. I've had the
4 opportunity to travel around and visit a lot of sacred sites
5 across this nation and have met a lot of wonderful, beautiful
6 people. This is religious genocide on the not only Apache
7 people, but among the other ten tribes in the Southwest region
8 that consider this a crossroads, a trading post to all of us.

9 I've never seen or heard of a project go through
10 church, go through a cemetery and desecrate your loved ones,
11 your own family members, your own people. I've never heard of a
12 project done before like that.

13 I've had many opportunities to pick medicine,
14 pick a lot of natural resources in the area for ceremonies, for
15 the Sunrise dance, for coming of age, for sweat. That's where
16 we gather wood, our grandfathers, or stones. I found an amazing
17 opportunity to learn the songs, to learn the history, the
18 meanings behind it, the teachings. There's no place else like
19 this in the world. There is no other region that houses such a
20 specific ecological area, all the animals, the plants here that
21 grow.

22 I had the opportunity to look at the information
23 earlier before this all started, talking about how once the
24 water is extracted and there's -- I'm assuming there's a plan to
25 keep track of how much water is used and try to replenish it,

1 but there's no way to truly replenish the water that's
2 underground. You can't pump it back in a crater the size of a
3 mile wide, a thousand feet deep, left.

4 This is religious genocide. It truly is, in the
5 purest form. I ask the ones that are in charge to make a moral
6 decision to stand strong. Look inside yourselves and ask
7 yourself would you do this to your own family, your own loved
8 ones, your own community?

9 Thank you.

10 MS. GRAMS: 22.

11 HENRY MUNOZ, SENIOR: Good evening. My name is
12 Henry Munoz, Senior, H-e-n-r-y M-u-n-o-z, Senior.

13 I Have 23 years of mining experience. I have
14 eight years in Superior prior to shutting down in '82, cut and
15 fill. I had another 13, block cave, San Manuel. When we shut
16 down San Manuel, we had 30 years of ore left underground. So
17 this story about 60 years of ore reserve for mining, it's not --
18 it doesn't happen. It's not true.

19 The reason I got involved with this, because my
20 drinking water is where I'm concerned. That's the water I
21 drink. At the beginning of the presentation, Mr. Bosworth
22 stated that it was a complex -- complex project. The most
23 complex he's ever dealt with.

24 I want to reference Chapter 4, under the Draft
25 EIS, under Cooperating Agencies. The United States Geological

1 Survey, which is basically a science bureau within the
2 Department of the Interior, declined to participate in the
3 study. I'll give you a rundown what the USGS does. It provides
4 science about the natural hazards that threaten lives and
5 livelihoods, the water, the energy, minerals and other natural
6 resources we rely on, the health of our ecosystems, of the
7 environment, and the impacts of climate and land use change.
8 Without them not being involved, it's like performing a
9 transplant in a hospital, and the cardiologist says, "Hey, I
10 don't want to have nothing to do with this." But why?

11 Second is no other mine has been block caved at
12 7,000 feet that I know of. Okay? Why can't there be an
13 alternative to this type of mining? That's like a lumber
14 company going up to Flagstaff and saying, "You know what? We
15 can't make any money up here and until we cut all the trees
16 down." Then what do you have left?

17 About twelve years ago I had spoke with a
18 professor named Dr. Robert McNish. Twenty-nine years with USGS.
19 Okay? He did consulting work at different mining companies with
20 land exchanges. He foresaw it and told me, "Henry, we're six
21 years into this drought." He said, "It's going to get worse.
22 Right now the native Americans are suing for the water, their
23 rightful water, and they're going to win. They're going to have
24 the key to our future here in this state." So lo and behold,
25 we're in a drought. Okay? So we're in a drought, and all of a

1 sudden we have the City of Gilbert buying a 100-year water
2 supply from the San Carlos Apache Tribe for \$31 million. Okay?
3 We have Gila River selling Chandler a 100-year supply of water
4 for 45 million, because you have to have that 100-year supply of
5 water.

6 So basically, what I'm trying to tell you is
7 that, you know what? This project is not going to go. There's
8 no way. We just -- we're in a drought. You have drought
9 contingency. Take action about our water. From the CAP, right
10 now we get 2.8 million from that. Half of that goes to the
11 tribe, and the other half goes to the State of Arizona. So
12 there is no water. That was my previous concern about this
13 project. Other agencies, cities are losing their share of CAP
14 water, so we have to look up to our future and protect our
15 water.

16 Thank you.

17 MS. GRAMS: Number 4.

18 LESLIE GLASS: My name is Leslie Glass,
19 L-e-s-l-i-e G-l-a-s-s. I live in Tucson.

20 And I also want to acknowledge that we are
21 gathered together here tonight on traditional Apache homelands.
22 This Copper Triangle is stolen land.

23 And there's a popular saying among
24 anthropologists that until you have fully immersed yourself in
25 another culture, that you will never truly understand your own,

1 and I've been looking for my culture. I'm just a European
2 colonizer. That's my ancestry. I have been immersed in the
3 Apache culture for the past four years, listening, learning and
4 participating in gatherings, ancient ceremonies, holy grounds,
5 Sunrise ceremonies, spiritual runs and cross-country spiritual
6 journeys.

7 I'm fully immersed in the Apache culture, and
8 fallen deeply in love with these people. They are my family,
9 and they are the people who are going to be harmed the most by
10 this mine. They're going to be harmed on the deepest, most
11 spiritual level, deeper than this mine could ever go. I -- I
12 can't even articulate the impact, the negative impact of that.

13 By 1878, nearly all Apache land had already been
14 taken, and all that is left is the reservation and the public
15 lands. Mining continues today at the peril of the Native
16 Americans across this nation. This land exchange is the epitome
17 of evil, and I pray to God every day that the people in power
18 will listen, and I pray tonight that you listen, and I do ask
19 that should any of the Apache speakers go over their three
20 minutes, please just let them speak. They need to be heard.
21 (Speaking native language.)

22 MS. GRAMS: The next five numbers are 13, 15, 17,
23 6 and then 16.

24 WENDSLER NOSIE, SENIOR: Wendsler Nosie, Senior,
25 W-e-n-d-s-l-e-r N-o-s-i-e.

1 First of all, you know, as a father and
2 grandfather, I'm really affected by this, to see my
3 granddaughter and the effects that it -- how it has affected
4 her, and it really changes what I want to say tonight.

5 You know, Mr. Bosworth, I've been at this since
6 day one. I've in the tribal government for 36 years, and we've
7 seen how this would all undermine right across the board, and
8 you know for a fact this is wrong from the very beginning. Even
9 when talking with Rick Ramsey, when Rick Ramsey was caught in
10 these deals and made a statement and said that this is a bad
11 deal, when we try to pull the cart before the horse. There's no
12 way that this should go. The American people know what has
13 happened. It would be a disgrace of what America is doing to
14 the people of this country. And this was the first one.

15 And then those are -- those of you from Globe,
16 Gosar tells us, Chairman Nosie, their goal is (unintelligible),
17 because everything's going to drop. So you might as well get
18 the reservation loaded with stores and everything, because now
19 the valley people are going to come through our area and hit the
20 same and go up towards the White Mountains. So you're going to
21 be able to get all that opportunity of business. Globe
22 (unintelligible) going to die. They're a dying town.

23 Those were the things that they said. But you
24 know what? Today the Apache people stand up for Superior, Globe
25 and Miami. We stand up for these people, for your children,

1 because to you, this is your home, just as almost as equal as
2 us. So what's really sad tonight, Neil Bosworth, by what you
3 just heard earlier, you're hearing what corporation versus the
4 natural world, corporation versus community, corporation versus
5 actual life, and if you're the one that's going to make that
6 decision, it's a moral decision. You're going to live and die
7 with that. So the best thing that you ought to do is turn that
8 back over to the Congressional people, because there's two bills
9 sitting there all ready to be heard. If the people of Arizona
10 can give that support and support you in that, knowing that you
11 have faith in our people, faith in this country, faith in a
12 moral decision, they would drop it back where all the other ones
13 started from.

14 So there's no way you can lie to me in the way
15 you lie to everybody else in this process with Resolution
16 Copper. Everybody's being bought. Everybody is. I have high
17 school friends in Globe who's come up to San Carlos to convince
18 me, getting paid 100,000, 50,000. It's a bad deal.

19 We walk through every day, through Oak Flats.
20 During our walk, we have people whispering to us, "We're with
21 you, but we can't say that because this is a mining town. We
22 can't say anything. We can't support you, but this is awful.
23 We don't even want to buy any more property."

24 So all of those things are happening. Let's wake
25 up and make the right decision. You have religious people

1 behind you. Religious people. You know, let's not -- what's
2 happening out there in Washington, let's not let that happen
3 here. Let's correct this country by making it better here so
4 that everybody else can get better in this country and the
5 healing begins.

6 Thank you.

7 NAELYN PIKE: My name is Naelyn Pike, N-a-e-l-y-n
8 P-i-k-e.

9 I strongly oppose Resolution Copper from
10 destroying and killing my culture, my religion, of who I am, and
11 you -- you here, I remember you. I remember you, and signing
12 and talking to us and smiling at us. Was that all fake?
13 Because eventually, you're going to tell me, tell my sister, who
14 had became a woman there -- and I was her partner -- to tell my
15 family and the people who come there to pray, to give their
16 heart, to give their life. Are you going to destroy that? Are
17 you going to give that corporation the money they want so they
18 can (unintelligible)?

19 It is up to you, and I can sit here and say
20 it's -- stand here and say, Neil, this is bad. All this stuff,
21 that eventually you're going to have to make the decision, and
22 it is your choice responsibility to the people in our community
23 in San Carlos, of the Apache people. Why aren't you guys there
24 talking to the people there? Not just the government. Because
25 you're talking to the local citizens here, in Globe, but San

1 Carlos, Apache, indigenous, the first people of the land.

2 It is up to us to -- you know, to pray, to be
3 there, and we are, and you're taking that away forever, forever,
4 for the generations so that my great-grandchildren, my future
5 children can't go there. So that my sister's land, where she's
6 prayed, where she put her knees on to ask the sun to give her
7 children, that's all going to be gone. And it is up to you, and
8 then we have to believe in you to make the right decision.

9 All of us here, Chi'Chil'Ba'Goteel is where we
10 come from. It is where we are born, where we can live and where
11 we can die, but we can't even experience that. We can't even
12 tell our future children, our future of our people that that
13 land -- this land here, you see this is where we used to pray.
14 We used to pick acorn. Now it's a complete waste. And it's
15 something that it could kill all of us. It could kill my
16 people. And it is our right. It's being discriminated -- our
17 right, our religious right is being taken away by Tonto National
18 Forest if they continue to make the decision to give it to a
19 foreign mining company who will take the money and leave.

20 So please make the right decision. Make the
21 right decision to continue a people, to continue a religion, to
22 continue a life, because you wouldn't do that to yourself.

23 (Speaking Native language.)

24 ANGEL HOOKE: (Speaking Native language.) My
25 name is Angel Hooke, A-n-g-e-l H-o-o-k-e.

1 I am from the San Carlos Apache Reservation. I
2 am a mother to a six-year-old little girl, right here. I was
3 raised on the reservation, and I was taught the Apache religion.
4 My grandmother, she was a big influence in my life. She taught
5 me about the surrounding areas and the history and the
6 sacredness of Oak Flats. If this mining goes through, it would
7 destroy -- it would be desecrating Oak Flats. The Creator
8 touched, blessed and made the land, the water, the plants, the
9 animals -- animals there.

10 As an Apache mother, it is important for me to
11 continue on the teachings to my daughter, for her to know that
12 she can go to Oak Flats and pray and get strength and to know
13 where she comes from.

14 In my religion, it was not a written religion,
15 and that's not fair, because in this world that we live in, it
16 has to be on paper, and if it's not on paper, it doesn't exist,
17 and that's not fair. This country is based on freedom of
18 religion, and yet my Apache religion is being disrespected due
19 to a foreign mining company.

20 If Oak Flats gets destroyed, it is gone forever.
21 It will never be the same again, and my daughter will lose that
22 history of the sacredness that was passed down generation --
23 generation to generation. Excuse me. We are all humans, and we
24 all have conscience, and our conscience tells that this is not
25 right. The Creator would not be happy with us if we continue --

1 if this mining continues to destroy Oak Flats.

2 Thank you. (Speaking Native language.)

3 MS. GRAMS: Number 6.

4 BAASE PIKE: (Speaking Native language.) Hello.

5 My name's Baase Pike, B-a-a-s-e P-i-k-e.

6 I would just like to say that I strongly disagree
7 with the -- with the Tonto National Forest, Rio Tinto destroying
8 Oak Flat. Oak Flat is really important to me. I'm my mother
9 Vanessa Nosie's young daughter that had my Sunrise ceremony, the
10 beginning of my woman ceremony, and I also helped my two cousins
11 that have their coming of age ceremony that become a woman, did
12 pick me to be a partner. So my sister was telling me -- she was
13 the one that had her Sunrise ceremony as well there.

14 So I would just like to tell you that if you take
15 Oak Flat away, you're taking a part of my life away. You're
16 destroying my culture, my religion. What's the whole point of
17 freedom of religion when you're going to take away Oak Flat?
18 That's my religion.

19 So I just want you to open your minds up and your
20 heart and just to stop a foreign mining company to destroying
21 Oak Flat, because Oak Flat means so much to us. My
22 grandchildren and my children and my cousin's children and my
23 sister's children, we all won't be able to show them where we
24 all, like, picked our acorns and we all prayed when we were
25 younger. So please, I just ask that you guys help save Oak

1 Flat.

2 Thank you.

3 MS. GRAMS: 16.

4 TOM WRIGHT: My name is Tom Wright, T-o-m
5 W-r-i-g-h-t.

6 These comments are related to the so-called Land
7 Swap Legislation, Section 3003 of the NDAA. I call it the land
8 theft legislation. Section 9B of that act requires that a
9 single EIS be completed in order to provide a full, complete
10 accounting of all the project's environmental impacts. This is
11 a pretty tall order for a massive, complex project with such
12 extreme and far-ranging impacts.

13 It's further complicated by the way the project
14 itself is not fully defined. It's an amoeba, an octopus, a
15 shape-shifter, or whatever other metaphor you might want to use
16 to describe something that simply can't be pinned down. It
17 keeps changing.

18 The idea of a single, all-encompassing EIS is
19 asking for the impossible. Yes, I'm aware that this is what the
20 legislation mandates, but that doesn't mean it's smart,
21 reasonable or even realistic. This project would transform what
22 is now public land into a privately-owned industrial zone. This
23 draft EIS is a rush development for political reasons, and let's
24 not pretend it's anything different.

25 In conclusion, I'd like to request an extension

1 of the comment period equivalent to the amount of time it took
2 to prepare the EIS. From March 2016, when the scoping began, to
3 August 2019 is three years and five months. Let's take that
4 same amount of time, not only for the public to review and
5 comment on this extremely complex document, but to give the
6 Forest Service the time it needs to come up with a full, fair
7 and meaningful analysis of the project's impacts.

8 Finally, I note that the legislation does not
9 specify how long the environmental review process should take.
10 There's no deadline, and there's no mandate for a rush job.
11 Let's take the time to do it right.

12 Thank you.

13 MS. GRAMS: Looks like the next five are number
14 3, 20, 19, 23 and then 25. So number 3.

15 CRANSTON HOFFMAN: Good evening. My name is
16 Cranston Hoffman. I'm a spiritual prayer warrior. And
17 C-h-r-s-t-o-n, Hoffman, H-o-f-f-m-a-n [sic]. San Carlos Apache
18 Tribe. (Unintelligible.)

19 And the issue that we're talking about here is
20 about the water. That's the main issue. As a child, back in
21 the old days, the elders used to talk about the future. I kind
22 of spent my time around the sweat lodge, and the elders would be
23 talking about how the water is going to become an important
24 issue, important thing into the future. And now, as of today,
25 we don't understand. What's this big thing about Oak Flat? Oak

1 Flat, you know, they want to destroy that land. And the Apache
2 people, where did they come from? Nobody really knows the
3 history. But the elders used to talk about how they used to
4 live here in Globe. These creeks, these valleys here, that's
5 where they came from, until they were removed down to old San
6 Carlos, because they discovered the minerals here. And that's
7 where we come from. That's what the elders used to talk about.

8 But the main issue that, you know, we want to
9 talk about is the water issue. How does that affect Oak Flat?
10 The elders used to talk about this Pinal Mountain. There's
11 fresh water in any land, fresh water that comes in from Mexico,
12 all the way through right there. Where does Globe water pump
13 their water from? Reservation land. The fresh water that comes
14 out of there. They well, they well, they well, all over the
15 place. They couldn't find any water, until they discovered --
16 our reservation line used to be here by Irene's restaurant.
17 That creek used to be the reservation line -- I remember that --
18 until they discovered the water. So they moved it back.

19 But the main issue that's going to affect that
20 water is the chemical that they're going to use in that mining.
21 And how is it going to affect it? It's going to go into the
22 crevices, and there's different deep, deep crevices that go, and
23 it's going to hit that fresh water there that we drink, and it's
24 going to affect the San Carlos Apache Tribe and the people of
25 Globe, and that's the main issue that we're concerned about.

1 Thank you.

2 MS. GRAMS: Number 20.

3 ANTHONY LOGAN: My name is Anthony Logan. I'm
4 from (unintelligible).

5 I've been staying at Oak Flat for two years.
6 I've been walking around, gathering acorn, medicine, everything
7 up there. There used to be spring water right there where the
8 creek is. Now there's nothing. We have holy ground. You know,
9 we used sing 16 song (unintelligible). You see a cross. They
10 put the cross back up again where we sing. After that, next
11 time we sing again, they put the cross up there. You know,
12 that's Apache land.

13 And I talked to Neil a long time where we had a
14 meeting, he said -- I told him, "You help us." He said, "Yeah,"
15 you know. I don't know about now, you know. You know, the
16 Apache people, we pray. We do everything. We pray for
17 everybody, you know, like friends and things, you know. Like
18 (unintelligible), too, you know. (Speaking Native language)
19 Geronimo, you know.

20 Thank you.

21 MITCHELL MICHAELS: My name is Mitchell Michaels,
22 M-i-t-c-h-e-l-l M-i-c-h-a-e-l-s. I live at Top-of-the-World.

23 I thought this evening I was going to stand
24 before you and read what I'd already dictated to the court
25 reporter before this meeting began. But after hearing what I

1 heard in Superior and again here this evening, I need to say
2 something different. I need to remind everybody of a portion of
3 what I said at the meeting in Superior.

4 I read every word of the Environmental Impact
5 Study. I read every word of the Draft Environmental -- or the
6 Executive Summary. I read every word of the Draft Environmental
7 Impact Study, but because I have no mining background, it was
8 almost as if I was reading a foreign language. But there was a
9 word I read over and over again. I wish I would have known this
10 in advance. I would have counted the number of times I read it.
11 The word is "mitigation." If you do not know what "mitigation"
12 means, it means to make something less severe or less harsh.

13 I believe in capitalism. I believe that every
14 company has the right to make as much profit in the marketplace
15 that their product will bear or bring. But no company, no
16 one -- it is a moral issue. No company has the right to make
17 one penny at the expense or the hurt of another human being, and
18 when you look at those documents, it is absolutely frightening,
19 and it's absolutely immoral to think that a company should be
20 allowed to impact the San Carlos Apaches or anyone else, the
21 people at Top-of-the-World that I came here to represent, and
22 say to us, "We heard you, but we're going to mitigate your
23 loss."

24 The example I gave in Superior was if you were to
25 take 100 pennies from me and you returned 10 of them, you

1 mitigated my loss. You made it less severe, although it is
2 still severe. If you were to return 20 or 30 or 50 or even 90
3 of my pennies, you have mitigated my loss, but I still have a
4 loss.

5 The moral thing that you have to think about and
6 the thing that is morally right is not mitigation. It's
7 restitution. "Restitution" means returning something back to
8 the condition it was before it was changed. If Resolution
9 Copper cannot do that, they should not be allowed to take one
10 ounce of ore out of the ground.

11 MS. GRAMS: 23.

12 CARRIE CURLEY: (Speaking Native language.)
13 Carrie Curley, C-a-r-r-i-e C-u-r-l-e-y.

14 Good evening, everyone. I want to thank each and
15 every one of you for hearing our words, our hearts. I want to
16 share with you what Chi'Chil'Ba'Goteel did for me. I am 31
17 years old, and I never thought that I would take on this
18 journey, as we call, of the Stronghold, a personal journey to
19 sacred unity.

20 For me, when Wendsler had addressed our community
21 about the water, the fight for the water, I heard him. He was
22 the Peridot council at the time. That's my district. And I'm
23 an artist, and what I brought to the table, I told him, is I can
24 bring my art as a weapon, meaning not like as a gun to hold, not
25 to be violent, but to awaken people, because you see with

1 artwork, the impact of artwork. It brings many messages, even
2 as the creator, as me, the artist, a young kid can interpret
3 that, the things that I didn't see that I painted, and that's
4 what Oak Flat has done for me.

5 Spiritually, it has given me such an impact.
6 Right now, in front of you is my flesh, my hair, but it's given
7 me a much more insight of myself and that spirituality. Today
8 in society, you see people who get outraged and curse and say
9 mean things to even their kids, innocent kids. That's out of
10 the flesh. But if you go deeper in that, it's spirituality.
11 You learn to pray for patience, for wisdom, for the right words
12 to say to your family, to your kids, even to yourself, because
13 we could hate ourselves. But that's what Oak Flat has given me.
14 I've marched for 44 miles off the reservation to
15 Chi'Chil'Ba'Goteel.

16 And like Wendsler said, his brother, a woman that
17 I -- I carry now in my prayers the teachings that she has given
18 to me, that he shares. I'm very grateful for that. It's to
19 take everything with you. In a car you bypass that. Life is so
20 fast. You bypass so many things in life. When you're walking
21 with your two feet that's God's given us, you take the trash,
22 you take the bad, you take the people who flip you off, you take
23 all that, and it changes you, and you carry all that, and when
24 you get there, and you make your destination, that's where the
25 impact is, and that's what Oak Flat has given me, an insight on

1 this community. I've gone to school here, and I graduated '07,
2 and I have a classmate here, and I just ask that each of you
3 just take that spirituality of Chi'Chil'Ba'Goteel and make an
4 impact on the future generations.

5 (Speaking Native language.)

6 MS. GRAMS: 25.

7 MARGIE CURLEY: Good evening, everyone. My name
8 is Margie Curley, M-a-r-g-i-e C-u-r-l-e-y.

9 I'm here as a prayer warrior. That's what I like
10 to do. I'm a prayer warrior. Since I've been to Oak Flat, it's
11 made me a stronger person. Made me want to stand up for what I
12 believe in and what the Creator has done for me.

13 I'm so thankful to be here tonight. As you can
14 see, I'm nervous, but I'm -- I was raised in Superior. I
15 graduated 1967, and I am 70 years old. I go on these walks
16 every year to Oak Flats, Mount Graham, and I thankful to be the
17 strong person that I am, and I will continue on with this fight
18 as long as I live.

19 I love Oak Flats. It's a place to pray. Just
20 the other day, last week, I told my daughter, I say, "I'm going
21 to Oak Flats. I need to pray." You know, when you're in
22 prayer, you feel something in here in your gut come up. That's
23 how I felt. When I got out of the car and I got out to Oak
24 Flat, I could feel this spirit moving in me, moving in me,
25 coming up, coming up. I cried, and I cried, and I cried. I

1 didn't know that this was going to be the last time I could say
2 anything for Oak Flats. I -- this is how I felt. And I prayed,
3 and that is holy -- truly a holy ground when you get up there.
4 You can feel the spirit. You can feel it rise in you, what it
5 has done to me. It rose me up, and it has taught me a lot.

6 And this is all I wanted to say is that I'm
7 standing here praying behind, praying beside me, and we're going
8 to go on, and we're going to march on. Nothing's going to stop
9 us, and we are strong. We are the strong Apaches. This is
10 (unintelligible) against us.

11 I was raised in Superior, and I sat -- I always
12 get lonely for Superior. I think often about my classmates, my
13 friends that I make there. Just yesterday I was telling my
14 coworker, I was -- because he bought a home there in Superior,
15 and I kind of laughed at him, and I said, "Your home is not
16 going to last very long." My friend, Stephen. And he laughs
17 and he says, "You know what? Resolution can pay me the big
18 bucks then, huh?" And I said, "I don't know about the big
19 bucks," I said. But Superior has always been my life, my love,
20 and that's where I was raised. So let's march on and keep on.

21 I want say thank you to (unintelligible).

22 MS. GRAMS: We have three more that are signed
23 up. Number 9, 27 and 28.

24 SANDRA RAMBLER: Are the activities of the Tonto
25 National Forest in conjunction with Resolution Copper company

1 undermining or usurping tribal sovereignty? Has the Tonto
2 National Forest fully analyzed the impacts of Resolution Copper
3 company's water consumption in the context of the forest, local
4 towns and ranches, or the region's water supply in light of the
5 drought?

6 Why should two foreign mining companies be exempt
7 from the National Historic Preservation Act, NEPA, our nation's
8 most important environmental and cultural protection law?

9 Protect and respect Apache cultural boundaries.
10 Protect unique ecological value of Oak Flat, Apache Leap and
11 (speaking Native language) where our Apache mountain spirit
12 dancers dwell. These are riparian masterpieces, and the
13 streamflow should be dewatered -- will be dewatered and dried up
14 by the mine.

15 Protect the unique bird life, butterfly,
16 dragonfly, native plant life, cactus, our Emory oak trees, our
17 holy grounds, our coming of age ceremonial grounds and
18 especially our water.

19 I understand 680,000 acre-feet of water will be
20 used to -- will be used over a 60-year span, and there are over
21 53,000 -- 53,000 buildings in Gila County alone that are
22 commercial and residential, and they all will be affected from
23 the -- about to be a obliterated mine, and this was not factored
24 in by Resolution Copper company.

25 Have you analyzed Resolution Copper's use of our

1 regional water supply? Water is life. I understand no tribe
2 has approved this published mining program and no tribe has
3 joined any partnership with Resolution Copper, and there are
4 over 21 tribes in Arizona.

5 There is no mention of Resolution Copper's
6 proposed cultural and environmentally destructive block cave
7 mining method. All ore can -- all ore can be removed by
8 traditional, safer, far less destructive techniques. Under NEPA
9 block caving, would be dropped as a viable alternative
10 immediately, and since NEPA will be bypassed, the public will
11 not be informed where the ore will be smelted and what part of
12 Arizona will be highly polluted, and they will certainly not
13 inform the public of the repercussions of the mine. They will
14 leave a big, giant hole for our grandchildren to clean up.

15 This NEPA-exempt bill circumvents any mention of
16 destruction or pollution of the water table, streamflows,
17 aquifers, wetlands and mine would be polluted, and they're going
18 to destroy us. Resolution Copper operates in secrecy, and they
19 evade U.S. human rights and environmental laws. They admitted
20 to creating a gigantic Arizona crater size which is a mile deep
21 and across, and the size of the Empire State Building.

22 And I'll reserve my comments for afterwards, and
23 hopefully I'll get some more time to say some more.

24 Thank you.

25 MS. GRAMS: Number 27. 28.

1 MICHAEL MACIAS: Hello. My name's Michael
2 Macias, M-i-c-h-a-e-l M-a-c-i-a-s.

3 I was wasn't planning on speaking today because I
4 spoke at another meeting, but there was a few things on the
5 video that I saw that are kind of concerning, and plus, I just
6 like looked at this thing that's at Superior already and also
7 somebody who was an intern for Resolution Copper.

8 You know, I kind of laugh sometimes when I hear
9 people champion this mine, and actually Rio Tinto and BHP,
10 because they're not someone to be the trusted. They -- it's
11 funny, because they do these things like remove tailings, and
12 they think it's a great thing, but the tailings in Superior are
13 a liability. The smelter, it locates a safety risk. Okay.
14 Look what's going to go in its place. You'll see in time that
15 it will be just something a (unintelligible). They have
16 intentions. All right?

17 You know, people here, I get it. Like people I
18 work with, they have jobs, mortgages, and they just do what they
19 need to do to take care of themselves, and I get that, but this
20 is so big and so long that I just -- I cannot keep my mouth
21 shut. I'm not somebody really to talk. I'm very introverted,
22 but this thing is just so wrong. It's been wrong since day one
23 when the crooked politicians like John McCain and Jeff Flake go
24 around and take state land, take land away from people who --
25 it's public -- it's public land. They noticed the natives.

1 This is something that should have been, you know, investigated
2 far more deeply so much earlier. It just -- it's mind boggling.

3 You know, I see so many things wrong with this.
4 I mean, okay, for example, the video, you know, somebody hiking
5 the Superstition Mountains 5 percent of the time will see a
6 haze. Okay. That's great for a person out there hiking, but we
7 live in Superior. 5 percent of 40, 50 years, anything beyond,
8 that stuff we're going to breathe all the time. So it's kind of
9 like don't minimize it. A thousand feet at Silver King. Okay.
10 It's going dry. Great. So little water. Great. Okay. It's
11 got decades and decades of water accumulating in it, percolating
12 through it, and this is going to be -- I don't know. It just
13 doesn't make sense. Sounds like a lot of minimization.

14 Now, I'm an aspiring biologist, so I love data,
15 and so the little time I had in with this, I went through where
16 I can look, and I was looking at the wildlife and all this kind
17 of stuff, hoping to see data, hoping to see, like, samples are
18 taken, detailed exploratory investigations into all this area,
19 and man, I saw so many assumptions on so many things. You know,
20 I went to the -- the Fish & Games to see data, and I was looking
21 forward to see how they were taking measures of everything, but
22 (unintelligible) points direction so they look at these things
23 and get a little more in depth with it. I just felt like, man,
24 there's so many things that are as important as this is, it's
25 just kind of like grazing over it so quickly. And that's

1 concerning, because the consequences of this, you know, water
2 that's going to be lost and taken, you know -- Colorado water is
3 just -- it's just -- it's just mind boggling. This whole thing,
4 it's just wrong. There's no other way to say it.

5 And so for the record and for whatever it's
6 worth, I hope this mine fails. You know, I hope it fails. This
7 is a mistake. It's a mistake.

8 MS. GRAMS: Okay. So we've gotten through all of
9 the people that signed up in advance. We do have more time for
10 the public hearing. So I would like to open up a three-minute
11 segment of comment to anyone who has not spoken already.

12 Okay. Do you want to -- and then I know that
13 over here we have -- you can go after he goes. Is that okay?

14 JOSEPH MONROI: Hello. My name's Joseph Monroi.
15 J-o-s-e-p-h M-o-n-r-o-i.

16 I'm from Dripping Springs, Gila County District.
17 I am next door to the Gila River. I take my three kids all the
18 time, every summer, any time I can get daddy time with my
19 children. You're taking that away from me. You've seen Erin
20 Brockovich. If you haven't, please go home and watch it.
21 You've seen what it's doing to our children, and you just want
22 to say, "Yes, I accept." Think about their children. Think
23 about our future. Think about the earth. Apaches, we already
24 took it away from them. Geronimo, all that, and we want to do
25 it again?

1 And plus, every -- every race. We all deserve a
2 chance, and I know everyone needs jobs, but there has to be
3 another way, another alternative, a safer way. We've done
4 hundreds of years of mining. Why can't we do it safe here for
5 our children? That's everything. We wouldn't be here if it
6 wasn't for children. And we really want to pollute that?

7 Cancer. There's so many possibilities that are
8 entering that water through these cracks, these veins, to our
9 trees, to our rapids, to our agriculture, to -- to mankind, and
10 they're literally saying, "Hey, Earth, we want to cut half your
11 life span in half so we can enjoy a couple more grams of copper
12 for a little bit more money in our pockets."

13 Well, let's change that. Let's say, "Hey."
14 Let's do what we have to do. Let's change it now. Let's get an
15 opportunity for everyone to have a say-so, and work with that
16 and say, "Hey, let's meet in the middle" and still do what you
17 got to do, sir. I know you have the courage. I know you have
18 the strength. I know you have God or whatever you believe in,
19 but just think of the children, think of cancer, and think of
20 how we can eliminate all of this, everyone. Amen.

21 ELISABETH HENNING: Good evening. My name is
22 Elisabeth, Elisabeth with an S, and Henning, H-e-n-n-i-n-g.

23 My family and I moved here, it was 2011, and one
24 thing that you have the local newspaper. What I was struck by,
25 the fact that the Apache people were dragged through the dirt

1 because of that idea about the Resolution Copper mine, and I
2 always thought people have an opinion, and you don't have to
3 drag them through the dirt.

4 So I am -- I come from a culture of European, and
5 we have a history of abuse. And I have to apologize to all the
6 people here, because white people have done a lot of bad things.
7 Maybe because we felt entitled because of our religion, because
8 it's so much better than yours. But I came to realize it's
9 actually not true. People cannot own the treasure of the earth.
10 They don't belong to companies. They don't belong to
11 stockholders. They have to belong to everybody, to the public.

12 So in this case, because there's so much -- you
13 know, so much at stake, I think that we have to reconsider, and
14 we have to look at the whole. The environmental disaster
15 belongs to everybody, and the people that walk away with the
16 money can import their water in France and Fiji, and we're left
17 with the mess that we cannot even imagine.

18 So I am -- we need a new culture. People are not
19 entitled of their religion, and because of their race, but I
20 think that God wants to see a peaceful world where people can
21 live in harmony with nature, and in nature, you know, when you
22 go out to the Indian reservation, there is a peaceful spirit,
23 you know. There's all kinds of things, but it's peaceful
24 spirit, because they have treasured nature all their lives, you
25 know, and we have to -- we have to adopt that.

1 And anyway, I know politics is a very active
2 thing now that you see, and it's always behind the back of
3 people. It's really actually not right, and so I think that we
4 should (unintelligible). This mining corporation can wait, and
5 maybe they find some other place where there's more copper,
6 better copper, that you can have some peace, some peaceful
7 support in this community, and this is also good for actually
8 people coming in, coming -- moving into Arizona, because this
9 area is absolutely spectacular between, you know, Superior and
10 all the way to Globe. It's very unique.

11 So thank you very much.

12 MS. GRAMS: Would anyone else like to take a turn
13 here at the microphone.

14 DENNIS WILEY: Dennis Wiley, W-i-l-e-y.
15 Forty-year miner, just retired. My brother's from Superior.
16 Brothers and sisters here.

17 I understand their concern, because the one of
18 mine is my dad's remains are there somewhere. Step-brother
19 died, didn't get along, doesn't tell me where they're at. So if
20 you find him, bring him home.

21 But anyway, my point is you're in a hard spot. I
22 understand that. I was a union leader. Hard decisions made. I
23 worked in Superior underground at the mill, Pinto Valley at the
24 mill, ASARCO Ray at the mill, heap leach.

25 Copper mines destroy copper. That's what they

1 do. That's their business. I'm against the way this mine is
2 going to be worked. This mine, they chose to do block cave
3 because it's cheap. Maximum profit. You can say no. They've
4 got so much money invested, they're going to mine it anyway.
5 They can do cut and fill. The tailings gets put back
6 underground.

7 Pinto Valley did a good job of cleaning the
8 tailings up in Miami. You see the nice contoured hills again.
9 It looks great. Freeport just buried theirs. So now you got
10 the steep piles. That's why you see the difference in the two.

11 This can be done. It's a hard decision for you.
12 It's a political decision. Like the gentleman said earlier,
13 they will try and get you fired. I know. I've been in that
14 spot. I was even a DPS officer for 23 years. It's hard
15 decisions. I feel sorry for you, but it can be mined. It will
16 be mined. The money is there. But if you leave all of the
17 copper mines all over the world that are being opened up, this
18 one's a small one compared to the ones over in Mongolia. I
19 think Rio Tinto's got that one over there. Putting a lot of
20 money in that. A lot of copper coming out of there. It's a
21 block cave. This one's a deep block cave. We don't need a big,
22 open hole that will be there for thousands of years.

23 That's all I have. Thank you.

24 MS. GRAMS: Is there anyone else here that hasn't
25 already spoken that would like to provide a comment?

1 SELINA CURLEY: Good evening. My name is Selina
2 Curley, S-e-l-i-n-a C-u-r-l-e-y.

3 I was born and raised in Superior until the age
4 of 21, and then I moved to the San Carlos Apache Reservation.
5 My father was a copper miner. It is not a job he loved. It was
6 a job that killed him. And money is not everything, as we know.

7 Mr. Bosworth, I would like to read to you from
8 John Muir, who was also known as the Father of National Parks.
9 He is a man who wrote books. Well, he was a philosopher. He
10 was a lover of the land. He was a lover of the earth. But I
11 want to read a quote by him. "Everybody needs beauty as well as
12 bread, places to play in and pray in, where nature will heal and
13 give strength to the body and soul alike."

14 The world that we're living in now is in dire
15 need of soulful places. A place where a person can go and their
16 heart is healed again. We live in a world where we're afraid to
17 just even go down to the grocery store. To be in a crowd like
18 this is a scary place now, and it's going to get worse. It's
19 not going to get better. It's going to get worse, and I know
20 that. And in reality, I think all of you know that, that safer
21 places and good places are disappearing from this earth faster
22 and faster and faster. You can't even go into a church and feel
23 safety there anymore, because we're not safe in a church.

24 So why in the world would we allow a foreign
25 company to come into America and basically rape and kill our

1 mother, the earth? It makes no sense. Now, I know and I
2 understand that we all need a roof over our head. We all need
3 cars to drive. We all need food on our tables. I understand
4 that. But I also understand this. I understand that the earth
5 is giving. I understand that there is a way to make money
6 leaving people to peaceful places and soulful places, that there
7 is a place and there is a job that people can have where instead
8 of taking from the earth, we can give the earth back to people
9 where they can find a peaceful place, where, like the gentleman
10 said, where he loves to take his children to. You're going to
11 take that from him. You are robbing his children of safety and
12 love and peace. Going to ask you please, please just think
13 about the earth.

14 Thank you.

15 MS. GRAMS: Anyone else who hasn't already spoken
16 that would like to provide a comment?

17 Okay. I will -- we do have more time, so I will
18 open up -- we have more time. So I would like to open up to
19 people who would like to continue to speak in three minute
20 increments. So Sandra.

21 SANDRA RAMBLER: The 7,000 foot deep mine will
22 suck dry the entire region (unintelligible). They will annually
23 import as much Colorado River CAP water as a city of 175,000.
24 Why is BHP, Rio Tinto, Resolution Copper so special? And why
25 were they given the exemption? Who paid who is my question?

1 The mine's toxic waste will be a gigantic mass
2 the size of Picketpost Mountain. They say they will dump these
3 poisons at BHP's nearby Pinto Creek mine. Twice BHP ruptured
4 their waste leak levees, in 1993 and 1997, spilling poisonous
5 heavy metals into Pinto Creek, which rolls into Roosevelt
6 Reservoir, Phoenix's drinking water.

7 Don't close your eyes and your ears over
8 development that is sucking the Verde and the San Pedro Rivers
9 dry. Don't let the Colorado River become America's most
10 endangered river. This is a ripoff, and I am outraged. You
11 should be ashamed of yourselves.

12 Who chose money over lives? Who chooses money
13 over lives? You cannot put a price tag on each and every one of
14 our lives. You are giving an exemption to two foreign mining
15 companies who are associated with Iran and Iraq to build a mine
16 on U.S. soil, on land that is holy and sacred to our Apache
17 people.

18 Executive Order 13175 directs each federal agency
19 to consult with American Indians that have substantial direct
20 effects on one or more American Indian tribes relating to
21 consultation and coordination with tribal governments. And
22 where is that? Where's your agreement? Where's your
23 partnership? Now, go do your job and tell the federal
24 government we do not want this foreign mining company to come
25 into our ancestral lands at Chi'Chil'Ba'Goteel, Oak Flat.

1 Six times the San Carlos Apache Reservation was
2 reduced by size because of mining, all the way from Tucson, all
3 the way up here to almost on the other side of Superior. All of
4 that. We have more and more land, but now we're just downsized
5 to a minimized land where -- where we're stuck with, but you've
6 already taken enough from us, and don't take any more.

7 And like others have expressed here, make it a
8 moral conscience. Make it a moral decision. My granddaughter
9 also had her ceremony there, and we're looking forward to having
10 my other grandchildren's ceremonies there as well. My
11 great-grandparents are buried there. I come from the Aravaipa
12 people, and I come from a clan that is just -- that is known to
13 have been there, and that we are still continuing to be there,
14 and you're going to that away from us, and it's just not right.
15 It's not fair. It just -- you know, may God let you rest in
16 peace when you're gone someday, knowing what you've done to us.

17 Thank you.

18 MS. GRAMS: Okay. I think that Roy, you're
19 raising your hand. Okay. Is there anyone else that would like
20 to continue to speak again? Okay.

21 ROY CHAVEZ: This is going to be short.

22 Just a couple of issues regarding financial
23 conditions, not necessarily with the company, but with the
24 project.

25 Now, first of all, as a state, outdoor recreation

1 provides about \$11 to 12 million a year in revenue to the State
2 of Arizona, while the mining industry today is providing about
3 \$5 to 6 million. I hate to compare that apples to oranges, but
4 quite honestly, they came there raising the hopes that they're
5 employing people and labor and giving people jobs, but as we all
6 know, those of us that have worked in the industry, we know
7 that's downsizing because of technology.

8 Having said that, I just want to remind this
9 crowd, if you have not seen this announcement, on July 14th of
10 this summer, this year, Rio Tinto announced in Bloomberg
11 Financial news that they were actually going to pull back on the
12 Resolution project here in Superior to concentrate on what
13 you've heard tonight, of Mongolia, of the Mongolia mine Roger
14 mentioned, Oyu Tolgoi, and a new ore that they discovered in
15 Australia, which is not as deep and not as cost effective in
16 regards to mining.

17 That should send a message that I'm trying to
18 spread in Superior with some of the few people and young guys
19 that are working for this company right now, not to really truly
20 invest, but to save their money, because as we all know, those
21 of us that have been in the industry and these communities of
22 the mining region, it's a spiking up and down situation for the
23 economy of this industry.

24 And just wanted to share with you that on Sunday,
25 the 22nd, this weekend, Concerned Citizens & Retired Miners

1 Coalition, along with Arizona Mining Reform, will host a
2 get-together at the Oak Flat campgrounds, and we will have some
3 representatives there that are going to talk a little bit more
4 in detail about the other side of this project in regards to the
5 negative concept of the project and how things might turn out.

6 We've done studies on the economy. We've done
7 studies on the tailings. We've done studies on the block cave
8 method, and the actual issue that is based in Mongolia. They're
9 having problems. It will be the same problem here.

10 If this project goes through, they have to build
11 a power plant, and that's what they're dealing in. I don't
12 believe that they're dealing with SRP. They're having to
13 construct their own power plant. That's what's happening in
14 Mongolia.

15 And by the way, financially, even the Mongolian
16 government and the people of Mongolia, in that contract
17 agreement with Rio Tinto, they're getting 34 percent of the
18 revenue. We're getting squat.

19 MS. GRAMS: Anyone else?

20 WENDSLER NOSIE, SENIOR: Just really quick,
21 granted myself, I've seen my children to be affected by this.

22 You know, Mr. Bosworth, you talked about
23 sustainability. You know, there's a choice here between
24 corporation and community and life, and I think that's a really
25 important word that you use, using that word, "sustainability."

1 And we know -- I mean, I don't know how many people know here
2 how this all came to be. Resolution Copper made several
3 attempts before this right, and Congressional leaders disagreed,
4 that this was not to happen, but it wasn't until our own
5 legislative leaders in the state of Arizona that pushed this
6 land exchange, and giving no right to anybody, giving no right
7 to the Native American people, of their religion, of how that
8 was going to be addressed, and you know that -- or I know you
9 don't know, if you do. But anyway, that's what took place, is
10 that the Congressional act was done, and this is why we're all
11 affected by this.

12 Now, from day one of public hearings to this day,
13 we see the big difference, because Globe and Miami and Superior
14 began to wake up. They began to question what's in this deal.
15 And now they're knowing that it's not right. It's not a good
16 thing for this whole region, because our accountability and the
17 way we would be self-sustaining is this water is left. Other
18 than that, we're completely wiped out.

19 And so I'm in town all the time talking to my
20 friends. I went to school. And all over, they're upset,
21 because they didn't know this was going on. So for these --
22 those of you out here, I went to the Miami mayor, Globe mayor,
23 Superior mayor, Apache Junction, all these places. Nobody had
24 the plan of operation. When we came here -- the chairman of our
25 tribe came here to meet with Globe. The city council turned to

1 the mayor and said, "Hey, all they want is the plan of
2 operation. Give it to them, because they didn't get it." Well,
3 come to find out the Globe council never had it. The mayor
4 never had it. None of these leaders that we have seen any plan
5 of operation. It was just moved forward with all the good talk
6 about moneys coming in. People are getting money are bought
7 off. They're the one that can suppress their own people and
8 their own towns, just like we are. Some people got hired to
9 suppress our own people.

10 This is an ugly, ugly deal, Mr. Bosworth, and you
11 know it. So if anything that you can hang onto to open a door
12 is the religion, because you know for a fact you haven't even
13 covered that, and it's -- it's an insult to see this. In only
14 two parts it talks about Apache. Two parts. And yet kids, kids
15 crying to you tonight.

16 So you don't -- I don't know about you, but for
17 us is that when we leave this earth is where God gives the
18 blessing, because what is in here is going to be opened up for
19 what we have done in the world. Now, I don't know if you've
20 gotten any money first before that. That's going to be a choice
21 you're going to have to make, but all we can do here is pray.
22 That's all we can do. That's all we got left. So I hope that
23 conscience of yours play a big effect, because we all need that.
24 We all need good people. Good people.

25 Thank you.

1 MS. GRAMS: Anyone else?

2 SPEAKER: I'm going to read back the comment that
3 I made during the scoping period about three years ago. Once
4 the EIS is completed, the land swap has been consummated, all
5 the permits have been issued and the mining starts in earnest,
6 what regulatory body, what bodies, will ensure that any
7 necessary mitigation, monitoring and other NEPA-related
8 conditions will actually be carried out? That was my question
9 three years ago.

10 The question -- I guess I'm going off script
11 here, so I'll probably ramble some, but I'm looking at the
12 clock. I had asked one of the Forest Service people at one of
13 the previous hearings the same basic question. You know, how do
14 we know that any of these good intentions that are stated here,
15 Resolution Copper, repeated in the EIS, how do I know that any
16 of these are actually going to be carried out? And he said,
17 "Well, it's in the law. It's written in the law." And I
18 thought laws get changed all the time. Laws get changed at 1:30
19 in the morning at back rooms at Washington, D.C., just hours
20 before it has to be voted on by the full Congress and signed
21 into law by the president as part of the military appropriations
22 act. The law means nothing. The law is just whoever is able to
23 most easily manipulate it for their convenience and profit. I
24 don't have any faith in the law anymore when it comes to matters
25 like this.

1 As I was also sharing earlier, I have been an
2 activist in various public land causes for almost 50 years, and
3 I worked with, not for, but with, as an activist, Barry
4 Goldwater, Mo Udall, others senators and representatives,
5 including at the time, back in the '80s, a new kid on the block
6 that had just come to Arizona named John McCain, and I will say
7 that he was great to work with at that time. He would listen to
8 us. He let us have a voice when we were talking about some of
9 these controversial issues. We would meet with him face-to-face
10 and talk about things and come to understandings, and not always
11 completely agree, but always we were able to have a voice.
12 There was a process. We followed it. It worked. That process
13 has been yanked away from us now.

14 And the question still stands, how are any of
15 these regulatory things going to be carried out if the law isn't
16 changed, if the EPA is abolished, as this new administration
17 wants to do, or if it's simply defunded, which is a convenient
18 end run around actually having to deal with the agency. You
19 defund the programs, you defund the agency, you appoint the
20 foxes to be in charge of the henhouse. There are ways around
21 all these things. I don't trust good intentions. We know what
22 the road to hell is paved with. I don't trust them anymore.

23 MS. GRAMS: So we have time for two more. So
24 this is one.

25 SPEAKER: You be strong with your courage and

1 power, because I just learned sign language. You tell them, "I
2 don't believe your bullshit." You keep our water, protect our
3 forest and keep your soul and your spirit, sir, because you're
4 going to protect all of us in this courtroom, our county, which
5 you're fighting for, and everybody else around us. You got it?
6 And you do it.

7 Thank you.

8 MS. GRAMS: Anyone else? Okay. This will be our
9 last speaker tonight.

10 HENRY MUNOZ, SENIOR: One of my main concerns
11 when this mine project was coming up was the water. Being a
12 blockade miner in San Manuel, I experienced and I saw what
13 ground movement could do and what it will do to your water
14 flows.

15 Okay. Another thing that has come up was the
16 proposed Superstition Vista development sitting between Florence
17 Junction and Apache Junction, just south of Highway 60. Their
18 projecting within 20 years there's going to be 1.2 million
19 people. They're figuring that the only way they're going to be
20 able to sustain the 100-water supply that's required for
21 development is to buy this CAP water. Okay?

22 This project in itself, the mine, it's going
23 to -- it's going to use enough water to fill up Apache Leap,
24 Apache Lake twice. It will use 40,000 acre-feet of water a
25 year. The same amount of water that the city of Tempe uses.

1 Okay?

2 Just recently with this DCP, Drought Contingency
3 Plan, when we were going through this drought, they negotiated
4 cutbacks to different entities, specifically states. Okay? The
5 farmers were getting excess CAP water, but once there was not
6 enough water in Lake Mead, that allowable water, the excess
7 water, they started cutting back. Governor Ducey's going to
8 propose to the Legislature that they set aside \$30 million for
9 extra drilling for the farmers, because there is no more excess
10 CAP water. Okay?

11 This is what Arizona's going to lose as a result
12 of the Drought Contingency Plan. Their CAP allotment.
13 Arizona's going to lose 192,000 acre-feet of water. Okay?
14 That's out of their allocated 2.8 million acre-feet. Nevada
15 will lose 8,000 acre-feet of water. Mexico will take -- will
16 lose 41,000 acre-feet of water. That's a 12 percent cut to our
17 CAP allotment here in the state of Arizona.

18 So just like I'm telling you. You know what?
19 This drought is going to get worse, and before you know it, the
20 water is going to get real expensive. It's not going to be
21 cheap. We've taken it for granted for all these years. You
22 know what? It's going to get expensive. Right now it's going
23 for more or less 5 to 6,000 for an acre-foot of water. That's
24 give or take a football field, and a foot high of water. That's
25 one acre-foot of water. That's enough to sustain a family of

1 two or three, maybe four, for one year. So look at it. Water
2 is going to be scarce.

3 Thank you.

4 (Hearing comments concluded at 8:25 p.m.)

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25